



THE

# Hungarian Historical Review

NEW SERIES OF ACTA HISTORICA  
ACADEMIÆ SCIENTIARUM HUNGARICÆ

*Holocaust Victimhood in Hungary:  
New Histories*

VOLUME **9** NUMBER **3**  
**2020**

Institute of History,  
Research Centre for the Humanities



THE

# Hungarian Historical Review

NEW SERIES OF ACTA HISTORICA  
ACADEMIÆ SCIENTIARUM HUNGARICÆ



Supported by the HUNGARIAN ACADEMY OF SCIENCES (HAS) and  
the NATIONAL CULTURAL FUND OF HUNGARY

**nka**  
Nemzeti Kulturális Alap

## Editor-in-Chief

Pál Fodor (Research Centre for the Humanities)

## Editors

Péter APOR (RCH), Gabriella ERDÉLYI (RCH), Sándor HORVÁTH (RCH), Judit KLEMENT (RCH),  
Veronika NOVÁK (Eötvös Loránd University of Budapest), Tamás PÁLOSALVI (RCH),  
András VADAS (Eötvös Loránd University / CEU), Bálint VARGA (RCH)

## Review Editors

Veronika ESZIK (RCH), Judit GÁL (Eötvös Loránd University), Janka Kovács (Eötvös Loránd University),  
Réka KRIZMANICS (CEU), Tamás RÉVÉSZ (RCH)

## Editorial Secretaries

Gábor DEMETER (RCH), Judit LAKATOS (RCH)

## Editorial Board

Attila BÁRÁNY (University of Debrecen), László BORHI (RCH), Gábor CZOCH (Eötvös Loránd University of  
Budapest), Zoltán CSEPREGI (Evangelical-Lutheran Theological University), Gábor GYÁNI (RCH), Péter HAHNER  
(University of Pécs), György KÖVÉR (Eötvös Loránd University of Budapest), Géza PÁLFFY (RCH), Attila PÓK  
(RCH), Béla TOMKA (University of Szeged), Attila ZSOLDOS (RCH)

## Advisory Board

Gábor AGOSTON (Georgetown University), János BAK (Central European University), Neven BUDAK (University  
of Zagreb), Václav BŮŽEK (University of South Bohemia), Olivier CHALINE (Université de Paris-IV Paris-  
Sorbonne), Jeroen DUINDAM (Leiden University), Robert J. W. EVANS (University of Oxford), Alice FREIFELD  
(University of Florida), Tatjana GUSAROVA (Lomonosov Moscow State University), Catherine HOREL (Université  
de Paris I Panthéon-Sorbonne), Olga KHAVANOVA (Russian Academy of Sciences), Gábor KLANICZAY (Central  
European University), Mark KRAMER (Harvard University), László KONTLER (Central European University),  
Tünde LENGYELOVÁ (Slovakian Academy of Sciences), Martyn RADY (University College London, School of  
Slavonic and East European Studies), Anton SCHINDLING (Universität Tübingen), Stanislaw A. SROKA  
(Jagiellonian University), Thomas WINKELBAUER (Universität Wien)

INDEXED/ABSTRACTED IN: CEEOL, EBSCO, EPA, JSTOR, MATARKA, Recensio.net.



Institute of History,  
Research Centre for the Humanities  
H-1097 Budapest, Tóth Kálmán utca 4.  
www.hunghist.org  
HU ISSN 2063-8647

# The Hungarian Historical Review

New Series of Acta Historica  
Academiae Scientiarum Hungaricae

Volume 9 No. 3 2020

## *Holocaust Victimhood in Hungary: New Histories*

Alexandra Szabó and András Szécsényi  
Special Editors of the Thematic Issue

### *Contents*

#### *Contents*

#### INTRODUCTION

ANDREA PETÓ, ALEXANDRA M. SZABÓ, AND ANDRÁS SZÉCSÉNYI 385

#### ARTICLES

TAMÁS CSAPODY Bor Forced Labor Service as Reflected in Diaries 391

ALEXANDRA M. SZABÓ The Corporeal Continuation of the Holocaust:  
A Look at Miscarriages 408

HELÉNA HUHÁK Place Attachment in a Concentration Camp:  
Bergen-Belsen 430

EDIT JEGES Hungarian Holocaust Testimonies in Global  
Memory Frames: Digital Storytelling about  
“Change” and “Liberation” 452

ANDRÁS SZÉCSÉNYI Hillersleben: Spatial Experiences of a Hungarian  
Jew in a German DP Camp, 1945 470

ISTVÁN PÁL ÁDÁM Budapest Butchers, the Jewish Question,  
and Holocaust Survivors 491

BORBÁLA KLACSMANN Neglected Restitution: The Relations of the  
Government Commission for Abandoned  
Property and the Hungarian Jews, 1945–1948 512

FERENC LACZÓ From Collaboration to Cooperation: German  
Historiography of the Holocaust in Hungary 530

BOOK REVIEWS

- Eastern Europe in Icelandic Sagas. By Tatjana N. Jackson.  
Reviewed by Csete Katona 556
- Účtovné registre Bratislavskej kapituly 1417–1529 [Account registers of the  
chapter of Bratislava, 1417–1529]. By Rastislav Luz. Reviewed by Petra Vručina 559
- Media and Literature in Multilingual Hungary (1770–1820).  
Edited by Ágnes Dóbk, Gábor Mészáros, and Gábor Vaderna.  
Reviewed by Csenge Aradi 561
- The Secular Enlightenment. By Margaret C. Jacob.  
Reviewed by Tibor Bodnár-Király 565
- “Kedves Hazámfiái, mozdulni kell...” Georgikoni peregrinatio oeconomica  
a 19. század elején [“Dear fellow countrymen, we must move...” The technological  
journeys of Hungary’s first college of farming in the early nineteenth century].  
By György Kurucz. Reviewed by Gábor Gelléri 570
- Universities in Imperial Austria 1848–1918: A Social History of a Multicultural  
Space. By Surman, Jan. Reviewed by Katalin Stráner 573
- Slovutný pán prezident. Listy Jozefovi Tisovi [Your Honor, Mr. President:  
Letters to Jozef Tiso]. By Madeline Vadkerty. Reviewed by Denisa Nešťáková 577
- Budapest–Bergen-Belsen–Svájc: A Kasztner-vonat fővárosi utasai  
[Budapest–Bergen-Belsen–Switzerland: The Budapest passengers of  
the Kasztner train]. Edited by Anikó Lukács. Reviewed by Borbála Klacsmann 580
- Hóman Bálint és népbíróági pere [Bálint Hóman and his trial  
at the People’s Court]. Edited by Gábor Ujváry. Reviewed by Andrea Pető 583
- New Perspectives in Transnational History of Communism in East Central  
Europe. Edited by Krzysztof Brzechczyn. Reviewed by Piotr Kowalewski Jahromi 587
- Magyar-zsidó identitásminták [Hungarian-Jewish identity patterns].  
Edited by Iván Zoltán Dénes. Reviewed by Attila Novák 591

Magyar-zsidó identitásminták [Hungarian-Jewish identity patterns].  
Edited by Iván Zoltán Dénes. Budapest: Ráció, 2019. 267 pp.

An interesting volume entitled *Hungarian-Jewish Identity Patterns* was published by the Budapest-based Ráció Kiadó in Hungary. The volume aims to trace the spiritual path of Hungarian (Neolog) Jewry through the fates of two Hungarian Jewish scholars, Henrik Marczali (1856–1940) and Bernát Alexander (1850–1927). The editor, Iván Zoltán Dénes, is the leader of the Henrik Marczali Research Group at the Jewish Theological Seminary at the University of Jewish Studies. Dénes analyzes how a 2018 conference which was held at the Institute of Philosophy of the Center for the Humanities of the Hungarian Academy of Sciences led to this volume. The spiritual foundation of the book is also provided by Károly Kecskeméti in his introduction, which focuses on the activities and identities of Neolog scholars or, as he writes in connection with the two scholars, “Jewish scholar[s] who at the same time identif[y] with the Hungarian nation” (p.9). Dénes also doubts the apologetics of assimilation, orthodoxy, and Zionism, as well as their idealization as an eternal explanation for every event, thus giving the *ars poetica* of the book, at least to be assumed.

We can read Mihály Huszár’s thorough study on Henrik Marczali’s father, Mihály Marczali, in the “Chapter of Identity Samples,” who was the first rabbi of the village of Marcali. Huszár writes about the role Mihály Marczali he played in the formation of the identity of the family. Dénes analyzes the Hungarian-Jewish identity of Henrik Marczali, and then Szilvia Peremiczky describes the appearance of three Hungarian Jewish authors (Bertalan Ormódi, József Kiss, and Emil Makai) in Hungarian literary life.

The next chapter is entitled “Situation Assessments, Strategies, Pathways I.” Here, Miklós Konrád deals with the problems of depictions of the Dualist era as the Hungarian Jewish golden age. András Zima writes about modern Jewish integration strategies at the turn of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, and Gábor Schweitzer examines the search for the Neolog rabbi identity in Hungary by analyzing the events between the rabbinical meeting in Győr and the foundation of the National Rabbinical Association.

In the next section, entitled “Location Assessments, Strategies, Findings 2,” Péter Zóka analyzes the role of Alexander Bernát at the Hungarian National Congress of Free Teaching. Péter Turbucz describes the views of Bernát Alexander and Henrik Marczali in a long study on World War I, and Péter András

Varga writes about Alexander Bernát and his circle of students as a “problem of philosophical history writing.”

The volume strives to situate a defining part of Hungarian Jewry within the framework marked by the oeuvre of the two great Neolog scholars. In this respect, this book can be said to have been successful, because not many professionals have tried to trace the process of the historical formation of the Neolog Jewish identity. Moreover, it is important to keep in mind that we are not talking about all of the Hungarian Jews at that time, but only about a community within this larger group, which means that we are only talking about a kind of intellectual history.

However, if we assume that historian Henrik Marczali and philosopher Bernát Alexander were role models for Hungarian Neolog Jewry, their unbroken enthusiasm for Hungarian national goals, for instance, which made them apologists for the “Great War” (as Péter Turbucz makes clear in his study), seems a bit odd today. Of course, it would be anachronistic to question the degree of enthusiasm at the time, yet at the same time, this unconditional loyalty and enthusiasm proved to be an illusion from a historical perspective.

I would like to highlight a few studies from the book which I feel are essential to an understanding of the message this collection of essays seems to endeavor to convey to the general readership. The essay by Miklós Konrád, which analyzes the attitude of the Hungarian Neolog public and intellectuals about dualism, is extremely interesting. Konrád convincingly demonstrates that, contrary to popular belief, the Neolog Jewry was dissatisfied with the conditions and was increasingly frustrated, and in the end, many of them took a left-wing turn, which in this case meant supporting the revolution of 1918.

The book offers insightful articles about Alexander Bernát and Henrik Marczali, which examine certain stages of their lives and their relationships to decisive historical events. Péter Zóka analyzes Alexander’s speech in Pécs (October 1907), which was delivered at the Hungarian National Congress of Free Teaching, where many people were present, from Oszkár Jászi to Ottokár Prohászka. Alexander, in whose view nurturing the desire for knowledge and raising the level of general education were the fundamental goals, condemned all uses of education for partisan political purposes and denied the accusation brought against him that he sought to relativize the truth.

At the end of the volume, Péter András Varga analyzes the circle of students of Alexander Bernát. Bernát’s disciples were extremely important people in the history of Hungarian fiction. Béla Zalai, who died in a Russian prisoner

of war camp, Jenő Varga, head of the Moscow Institute of World Economy, Vilmos Szilasi, who had a “European career,” and Béla Fogarasi, an important personality of Hungarian Marxist-Leninist philosophy, were all talents whose early interests were significantly influenced by Alexander. Varga sees in the phenomenological philosophical connection the point where these personalities were also connected to one another.

My main criticism of the book would be that it is a somewhat haphazard compilation of very high-quality studies. It sheds light on the careers of the two prominent Hungarian Jewish scholars in many respects, and it offers clear explanations of the relevance of their activities to the Hungarian Jewish intelligentsia in general. We are talking about people who were Jews but who considered themselves Jewish on the basis of religion only and who were otherwise essentially assimilated. They identified themselves as Hungarian, and in this respect, they also stressed the importance of being more than a member of a given nation. However, their unflinching Hungarian nationalism proved to be a failure in all respects, and this caused them great frustration and, paradoxically, prompted them to identify more passionately with the idea of the integral Hungarian state. This was paradoxical given the events of the subsequent decades, when the notion of the Hungarian state as defined by the borders of the medieval Hungarian kingdom proved a mirage, as did the notion that Hungarian society accepted Jews as Hungarians.

This volume is a significant contribution to the secondary literature in part because it brings identity disputes off the emotional plane and places them between the cornerstones of the historical facts and science.

Attila Novák  
Thomas Molnár Institute for Advanced Studies /  
National University for Public Service

THE

# Hungarian Historical Review

## Aims and Scope

The Hungarian Historical Review is a peer-reviewed international journal of the social sciences and humanities with a focus on Hungarian history. The journal's geographical scope—Hungary and East-Central Europe—makes it unique: the Hungarian Historical Review explores historical events in Hungary, but also raises broader questions in a transnational context. The articles and book reviews cover topics regarding Hungarian and East-Central European History. The journal aims to stimulate dialogue on Hungarian and East-Central European History in a transnational context. The journal fills lacuna, as it provides a forum for articles and reviews in English on Hungarian and East-Central European history, making Hungarian historiography accessible to the international reading public and part of the larger international scholarly discourse.

## The Hungarian Historical Reviews

(Formerly *Acta Historica Academiae Scientiarum Hungaricae*)

4 Tóth Kálmán utca, Budapest H – 1097 Hungary

Postal address: H-1453 Budapest, P.O. Box 33. Hungary

E-mail: [hunghist@btk.mta.hu](mailto:hunghist@btk.mta.hu)

Homepage: <http://www.hunghist.org>

Published quarterly by the Institute of History,  
Research Centre for the Humanities (RCH).

Responsible Editor: Pál Fodor (Director General).

Prepress preparation by the Institute of History, RCH, Research Assistance Team;  
Leader: Éva Kovács. Page layout: Imre Horváth. Cover design: Gergely Böhm.

Printed in Hungary, by Prime Rate Kft, Budapest.

Translators/proofreaders: Alan Campbell, Matthew W. Caples, Thomas Cooper,  
Sean Lambert, Thomas Szerecz.

Annual subscriptions: \$80/€60 (\$100/€75 for institutions), postage excluded.

For Hungarian institutions HUF7900 per year, postage included.

Single copy \$25/€20. For Hungarian institutions HUF2000.

Send orders to *The Hungarian Historical Review*, H-1453 Budapest, P.O. Box 33.  
Hungary; e-mail: [hunghist@btk.mta.hu](mailto:hunghist@btk.mta.hu)

Articles, books for review, and correspondence concerning editorial matters,  
advertising, or permissions should be sent to *The Hungarian Historical Review*,  
*Editorial*, H-1453 Budapest, P.O. Box 33. Hungary; e-mail: [hunghist@btk.mta.hu](mailto:hunghist@btk.mta.hu).  
Please consult us if you would like to propose a book for review or a review essay.

Copyright © 2020 *The Hungarian Historical Review* by the Institute of History,  
Research Centre for the Humanities.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced, stored, transmitted,  
or disseminated in any form or by any means without prior written permission  
from the publisher.



THE

# Hungarian Historical Review

*Holocaust Victimhood in Hungary: New Histories*

## CONTENTS

<i>Introduction</i>	A. PETŐ, A. M. SZABÓ, A. SZÉCSÉNYI	385
<i>Bor Forced Labor Service as Reflected in Diaries</i>	T. CSAPODY	391
<i>The Corporeal Continuation of the Holocaust: A Look at Miscarriages</i>	A. M. SZABÓ	408
<i>Place Attachment in a Concentration Camp: Bergen-Belsen</i>	H. HUHÁK	430
<i>Hungarian Holocaust Testimonies in Global Memory Frames</i>	E. JEGES	452
<i>Hillersleben: Spatial Experiences of a Hungarian Jew</i>	A. SZÉCSÉNYI	470
<i>Budapest Butchers, the Jewish Question, and Holocaust Survivors</i>	I. P. ÁDÁM	491
<i>The Government Commission for Abandoned Property and the Hungarian Jews</i>	B. KLACSMANN	512
<i>German Historiography of the Holocaust in Hungary</i>	F. LACZÓ	530



HU ISSN  
2063-8647



9 772063 864004 2 0003