



THE

Hungarian Historical Review

NEW SERIES OF ACTA HISTORICA
ACADEMIÆ SCIENTIARUM HUNGARICÆ

*Holocaust Victimhood in Hungary:
New Histories*

VOLUME 9 NUMBER 3
2020

Institute of History,
Research Centre for the Humanities

THE

Hungarian Historical Review

NEW SERIES OF ACTA HISTORICA
ACADEMIÆ SCIENTIARUM HUNGARICÆ



Supported by the HUNGARIAN ACADEMY OF SCIENCES (HAS) and
the NATIONAL CULTURAL FUND OF HUNGARY



Nemzeti Kulturális Alap

Editor-in-Chief

Pál Fodor (Research Centre for the Humanities)

Editors

Péter APOR (RCH), Gabriella ERDÉLYI (RCH), Sándor HORVÁTH (RCH), Judit KLEMENT (RCH),
Veronika NOVÁK (Eötvös Loránd University of Budapest), Tamás PÁLOSFAI (RCH),
András VADAS (Eötvös Loránd University / CEU), Bálint VARGA (RCH)

Review Editors

Veronika ESZIK (RCH), Judit GÁL (Eötvös Loránd University), Janka KOVÁCS (Eötvös Loránd University),
Réka KRIZMANICS (CEU), Tamás RÉVÉSZ (RCH)

Editorial Secretaries

Gábor DEMETER (RCH), Judit LAKATOS (RCH)

Editorial Board

Attila BÁRÁNY (University of Debrecen), László BORHI (RCH), Gábor CZOCH (Eötvös Loránd University of
Budapest), Zoltán CSEPREGI (Evangelical-Lutheran Theological University), Gábor GYÁNI (RCH), Péter HAHNER
(University of Pécs), György KÖVÉR (Eötvös Loránd University of Budapest), Géza PÁLFFY (RCH), Attila PÓK
(RCH), Béla TOMKA (University of Szeged), Attila ZSOLDOS (RCH)

Advisory Board

Gábor AGOSTON (Georgetown University), János BAK (Central European University), Neven BUDAK (University
of Zagreb), Václav BŮŽEK (University of South Bohemia), Olivier CHALINE (Université de Paris-IV Paris-
Sorbonne), Jeroen DUINDAM (Leiden University), Robert J. W. EVANS (University of Oxford), Alice FREIFELD
(University of Florida), Tatjana GUSAROVA (Lomonosov Moscow State University), Catherine HOREL (Université
de Paris I Panthéon-Sorbonne), Olga KHAVANOVA (Russian Academy of Sciences), Gábor KLANICZAY (Central
European University), Mark KRAMER (Harvard University), László KONTLER (Central European University),
Tünde LENGYELOVÁ (Slovakian Academy of Sciences), Martyn RADY (University College London, School of
Slavonic and East European Studies), Anton SCHINDLING (Universität Tübingen), Stanisław A. SROKA
(Jagiellonian University), Thomas WINKELBAUER (Universität Wien)

INDEXED/ABSTRACTED IN: CEEOL, EBSCO, EPA, JSTOR, MATARKA, Recensio.net.



Institute of History,
Research Centre for the Humanities
H-1097 Budapest, Tóth Kálmán utca 4.
www.hunghist.org
HU ISSN 2063-8647

The Hungarian Historical Review

New Series of Acta Historica
Academiae Scientiarum Hungaricae

Volume 9 No. 3 2020

Holocaust Victimhood in Hungary: New Histories

Alexandra Szabó and András Szécsényi
Special Editors of the Thematic Issue

Contents

Contents

INTRODUCTION

ANDREA PETŐ, ALEXANDRA M. SZABÓ, AND ANDRÁS SZÉCSÉNYI 385

ARTICLES

TAMÁS CSAPODY Bor Forced Labor Service as Reflected in Diaries 391

ALEXANDRA M. SZABÓ The Corporeal Continuation of the Holocaust:
A Look at Miscarriages 408

HELÉNA HUHÁK Place Attachment in a Concentration Camp:
Bergen-Belsen 430

EDIT JEGES Hungarian Holocaust Testimonies in Global
Memory Frames: Digital Storytelling about
“Change” and “Liberation” 452

ANDRÁS SZÉCSÉNYI Hillersleben: Spatial Experiences of a Hungarian
Jew in a German DP Camp, 1945 470

ISTVÁN PÁL ÁDÁM Budapest Butchers, the Jewish Question,
and Holocaust Survivors 491

BORBÁLA KLACSMANN Neglected Restitution: The Relations of the
Government Commission for Abandoned
Property and the Hungarian Jews, 1945–1948 512

FERENC LACZÓ From Collaboration to Cooperation: German
Historiography of the Holocaust in Hungary 530

BOOK REVIEWS

- Eastern Europe in Icelandic Sagas. By Tatjana N. Jackson.
Reviewed by Csete Katona 556
- Účtovné registre Bratislavskej kapituly 1417–1529 [Account registers of the chapter of Bratislava, 1417–1529]. By Rastislav Luz. Reviewed by Petra Vručina 559
- Media and Literature in Multilingual Hungary (1770–1820).
Edited by Ágnes Dóbék, Gábor Mészáros, and Gábor Vaderna.
Reviewed by Csenge Aradi 561
- The Secular Enlightenment. By Margaret C. Jacob.
Reviewed by Tibor Bodnár-Király 565
- “Kedves Hazámfiái, mozdulni kell...” Georgikoni peregrinatio oeconomica a 19. század elején [“Dear fellow countrymen, we must move...” The technological journeys of Hungary’s first college of farming in the early nineteenth century].
By György Kurucz. Reviewed by Gábor Gelléri 570
- Universities in Imperial Austria 1848–1918: A Social History of a Multicultural Space. By Surman, Jan. Reviewed by Katalin Stráner 573
- Slovutný pán prezident. Listy Jozefovi Tisovi [Your Honor, Mr. President: Letters to Jozef Tiso]. By Madeline Vadkerty. Reviewed by Denisa Nešťáková 577
- Budapest–Bergen-Belsen–Svájc: A Kasztner-vonat fővárosi utasai [Budapest–Bergen-Belsen–Switzerland: The Budapest passengers of the Kasztner train]. Edited by Anikó Lukács. Reviewed by Borbála Klacsmann 580
- Hóman Bálint és népbíróági pere [Bálint Hóman and his trial at the People’s Court]. Edited by Gábor Ujváry. Reviewed by Andrea Pető 583
- New Perspectives in Transnational History of Communism in East Central Europe. Edited by Krzysztof Brzechczyn. Reviewed by Piotr Kowalewski Jahromi 587
- Magyar-zsidó identitásminták [Hungarian-Jewish identity patterns].
Edited by Iván Zoltán Dénes. Reviewed by Attila Novák 591

BOOK REVIEWS

Eastern Europe in Icelandic Sagas. By Tatjana N. Jackson. Amsterdam: ARC Humanities Press–Amsterdam University Press, 2019. 228 pp.

The series, *Beyond Medieval Europe* (published by ARC Humanities Press), targets topics previously neglected in Anglophone scholarship which are related to the history of the peripheries of medieval Europe. In this regard, Tatjana Jackson's new book, her first in English, is a big success, as it presents what people on one edge of the continent, medieval Iceland, knew about the other fringe, Eastern Europe. Jackson is one of the leading Russian experts on medieval Scandinavia and its relations to the Early (or Old) Rus', and she offers now a reworked and updated version of her findings previously published for the most part in Russian. The title of the book, *Eastern Europe in Icelandic Sagas*, is a little misleading, as it mostly discusses information pertaining to ninth–eleventh-century Rus', whilst one would expect to find details in the book about other territories too, such as Poland or Hungary, even if these territories feature less frequently in the Old Norse Icelandic corpus.

Jackson begins with an introductory chapter on her aims, sources, and methodology (pp.1–17). The book is then divided into two major parts, the first and longer of which presents the place of Eastern Europe (actually modern-day European Russia, Ukraine, and Belarus in geographical terms) in the Old Norse worldview (pp.19–114), while the second focuses on the stay of four Norwegian kings in Old Rus' (pp.115–70). The research questions in both parts are clearly formulated: what do the Old Norse sources reveal concerning knowledge of Eastern Europe, and how much of this information is historically reliable? Given the nature of the source material, namely that the Icelandic sagas usually describe events from the Viking Age (or earlier) but were committed to parchment only beginning in the twelfth century (and most were written down in later centuries), the methodology section is indispensable for an understanding of the whole argument.

Jackson introduces the three main types of sources of which she makes use: skaldic poetry, sagas, and runic inscriptions. Of these, the first two receive the most attention. Skaldic poetry was usually produced by eyewitnesses or first-hand informants, and due to its metrical complexity, it hardly changed until it was written down in later centuries and thus is usually regarded as authentic. Sagas, on the other hand, are viewed today with much criticism as historical

sources due to their literary nature, the fact that they were recorded significantly later, and the fact that their authors included narrative interventions (or least to the consensus in the secondary literature). According to Jackson, the early kings' sagas, written down before the great compendium of 1220–1230, preserved authentic knowledge of the ninth-tenth-century Scandinavians about the geography of the "east" in the form of place names and navigable river routes. The later sagas, however, continued to rely on the ninth-century and early tenth-century conditions when describing events in Eastern Europe (simply copying the earlier compendium) and did not follow up on the southward advancement of the Scandinavians. In Jackson's view, this explains why places names such as Kiev (*Kænugarðr* in the sagas) do not receive prominence in the sagas and Novgorod (*Hólmgarðr*) is displayed as a capital of the Rus'.

The first part of the book vividly illustrates with a sound handling of the source material how information was transmitted and could change shape (media) during its formation from orality to literacy. More importantly, it shows that the Icelandic sagas reveal details about Eastern Europe left unmentioned in other documents. We learn that Ladoga's presentation in the sagas as a possible toll and control station where foreigners were checked and safe conduct was issued was a remnant of historical memory, as was Polotsk's strong fortress and defense system.

In the second part, the logic of applying the methodology twists a little. The Russian sources make no mention of the four Norwegian kings who visited Rus' (Olaf Tryggvason, Olaf Haraldsson, Magnus Olafsson, Harald Sigurdarson). Jackson, however, feels that their presence in Rus' cannot be cast into question, since it was confirmed by the skaldic poets. It would thus be inconceivable that they did not travel to Rus'. However, any other information in the sagas which is not confirmed by skaldic poets (Jackson suggests) is either falsification or the projection of later medieval conditions on the Viking Age. Thus, the goal is not really to squeeze out every useful bit of information from the sagas (as in the first part), but to call into question anything from the prose narrative which is unconfirmed by contemporary reports. Jackson questions saga accounts with rigorous source criticism and demonstrates how the great influence and deeds of a "later-Norwegian king abroad" are exaggerated by saga authors.

Jackson notes that in a few cases not all information found in the sagas is unreliable (e.g. Harald Sigurdarson's stay and activity in Rus', such as his use of Jaroslav the Wise to bank his amassed Byzantine wealth). I would suggest that by less strict with her methodology, Jackson would have had even more positive

results. First of all, skaldic poetry was usually produced precisely to meet the demands made by the kings (and always with the intention of praising the ruler) and thus should not be taken at face value. The magical healing skill of Saint Olaf's body as recorded in skaldic poetry (p.137) is just one example of overstatement. Second, skaldic poetry was not produced about every event in a saga. This does not mean that every detail of a political history in a saga is *de facto* a fabrication. The details may not always be accurate, but sagas often present what we call "potentially believable stories," i.e. situations which probably occurred. Even if it is not possible to link them, on the basis of other sources, to a precise person or situation. In this regard, I would not immediately dismiss the possibility that a Scandinavian warlord was exacting tributes (or mustering forces) among the Chuds for a tenth-century prince in Rus', nor would I see Olaf Tryggvason's imprisonment as a reflection of fear from thirteenth-century Estonian pirates (pp.121–23), especially since the slave childhood of a future Norwegian king hardly adds anything to the "building-up" of a glorious character and thus could easily have been omitted by a saga author had it not been a well-known fact to other contemporaries.

These critical remarks notwithstanding, the book is a welcome contribution both to the wave of studies which aim to illuminate the Eastern sphere of the continent and to the branch of sagas studies that turns back to the historical reality behind this literature. Although its specialist nature possibly makes it a hard read for scholars untrained in Old Norse philology, Jackson's work reminds us of the value of consulting Russian scholarship when dealing with Icelandic sagas and the Vikings.

Csete Katona
University of Debrecen

THE

Hungarian Historical Review

Aims and Scope

The Hungarian Historical Review is a peer-reviewed international journal of the social sciences and humanities with a focus on Hungarian history. The journal's geographical scope—Hungary and East-Central Europe—makes it unique: the Hungarian Historical Review explores historical events in Hungary, but also raises broader questions in a transnational context. The articles and book reviews cover topics regarding Hungarian and East-Central European History. The journal aims to stimulate dialogue on Hungarian and East-Central European History in a transnational context. The journal fills lacuna, as it provides a forum for articles and reviews in English on Hungarian and East-Central European history, making Hungarian historiography accessible to the international reading public and part of the larger international scholarly discourse.

The Hungarian Historical Reviews

(Formerly *Acta Historica Academiae Scientiarum Hungaricae*)

4 Tóth Kálmán utca, Budapest H – 1097 Hungary

Postal address: H-1453 Budapest, P.O. Box 33. Hungary

E-mail: hunghist@btk.mta.hu

Homepage: <http://www.hunghist.org>

Published quarterly by the Institute of History,
Research Centre for the Humanities (RCH).

Responsible Editor: Pál Fodor (Director General).

Prepress preparation by the Institute of History, RCH, Research Assistance Team;
Leader: Éva Kovács. Page layout: Imre Horváth. Cover design: Gergely Böhm.

Printed in Hungary, by Prime Rate Kft, Budapest.

Translators/proofreaders: Alan Campbell, Matthew W. Caples, Thomas Cooper,
Sean Lambert, Thomas Szerecz.

Annual subscriptions: \$80/€60 (\$100/€75 for institutions), postage excluded.

For Hungarian institutions HUF7900 per year, postage included.

Single copy \$25/€20. For Hungarian institutions HUF2000.

Send orders to *The Hungarian Historical Review*, H-1453 Budapest, P.O. Box 33.
Hungary; e-mail: hunghist@btk.mta.hu

Articles, books for review, and correspondence concerning editorial matters,
advertising, or permissions should be sent to *The Hungarian Historical Review*,
Editorial, H-1453 Budapest, P.O. Box 33. Hungary; e-mail: hunghist@btk.mta.hu. Please consult us if you would like to propose a book for review or a review essay.

Copyright © 2020 *The Hungarian Historical Review* by the Institute of History,
Research Centre for the Humanities.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced, stored, transmitted,
or disseminated in any form or by any means without prior written permission
from the publisher.

THE

Hungarian Historical Review

Holocaust Victimhood in Hungary: New Histories

CONTENTS

<i>Introduction</i>	A. PETŐ, A. M. SZABÓ, A. SZÉCSÉNYI	385
<i>Bor Forced Labor Service as Reflected in Diaries</i>	T. CSAPODY	391
<i>The Corporeal Continuation of the Holocaust: A Look at Miscarriages</i>	A. M. SZABÓ	408
<i>Place Attachment in a Concentration Camp: Bergen-Belsen</i>	H. HUHÁK	430
<i>Hungarian Holocaust Testimonies in Global Memory Frames</i>	E. JEGES	452
<i>Hillersleben: Spatial Experiences of a Hungarian Jew</i>	A. SZÉCSÉNYI	470
<i>Budapest Butchers, the Jewish Question, and Holocaust Survivors</i>	I. P. ÁDÁM	491
<i>The Government Commission for Abandoned Property and the Hungarian Jews</i>	B. KLACSMANN	512
<i>German Historiography of the Holocaust in Hungary</i>	F. LACZÓ	530

hr

HU ISSN
2063-8647



9 772063 864004



2 0003