

On The Words *ile* in *Dîvânu Lugâti't-Türk* and *ayla* in *Kutadgu Bilig*

GÜLDEN SAĞOL YÜKSEKKAYA*

Marmara University, 34722 Göztepe, Istanbul, Turkey

Received: March 26, 2020 • Accepted: February 20, 2021

© 2021 Akadémiai Kiadó, Budapest



ABSTRACT

Kutadgu Bilig is one of the most important treasures of Turkish history, art, language, and literature as well as Turkish cultural history, whereas *Dîvânu Lugâti't-Türk* demonstrates the wealth of Turkish culture and civilization. Hundreds of studies have been done on these two works, yet they still pose many questions waiting to be answered. This article focuses on the word read as *ila* in *Dîvânu Lugâti't-Türk* and *Kutadgu Bilig* and recommends a new way of reading it.

KEYWORDS

ila, ile, ayla, Dîvânu Lugâti't-Türk, Kutadgu Bilig

* Corresponding author. E-mail: guldensagol@marmara.edu.tr

Kutadgu Bilig is the work in which Yûsuf Hâs Hâcib analyzes human life and constructs a life philosophy; it reflects traces of pre-Islamic Turkish thought alongside the Turkish adaptation to the Islamic civilization and is one of the most important treasures of Turkish history, art, language, and literature as well as Turkish cultural history. *Dîvânu Lugâtî't-Türk*, meanwhile, is a magnificent work in which Kâşgarlı Mahmud broke new ground in terms of Turkish lexicology by using a standard language to scrutinize in detail the linguistic properties and vocabularies of the other Turkish communities.

While hundreds of studies have been done on these two important works, the fact remains that they still pose many questions waiting to be answered. This study deliberates upon the word read as *ila* in *Dîvânu Lugâtî't-Türk* and *ayla* in *Kutadgu Bilig* and suggests a new way of reading it.

THE WAY THE WORD *ILA* IS READ IN *DÎVÂNU LUGÂTÎ'T-TÛRK*

The word in question is read by *Dîvânu Lugâtî't-Türk*'s editors as follows: Atalay (1986: 840) read it as '*ila*' and '*il*', Ercilasun and Akkoyunlu (2015: 656) as '*ila*' and '*:la*', Dankoff and Kelly (1985/III: 33) as '*ila*', Abbas (1981/I: 81) as '*ila*', Avezovoy (2005: 123) as '*ilâ*', Əskər (2006: 155) as '*ila*', and A. Egevbayev (1997/I: 121) as '*ila*' but also noting that it can be read as '*ile*' while proceeding to invariably read it as '*ila*' in his *Kutadgu Bilig* edition.²

The word read as *ila*, *il*, *ila*, *ile*, and *ilâ* in the various editions of *Dîvânu Lugâtî't-Türk* appear as the name of a river there. Kâşgarlı Mahmud indicates this river to be 'the river known as the Ceyhun of Turkish lands whose two sides are settled by the Yağmas, Toxsıs, and some of the Çigils' (Kâş. 58).³ In addition to this bit of information, the name of this river occurs six more times throughout *Dîvânu Lugâtî't-Türk*.

In the section on Turkish Dialects, Kâşgarlı Mahmud mentions اِیلا as follows:

'The lightest language is that of the Oghuz. The most correct languages are those of the Yağmas and Toxsıs, as well as of those who dwell in the Etil, Yamar, Ertiş, and اِیلا valleys all the way to the Uyghur cities' (Kâş. 25).

'... One city on the frontier is named *İki Ügüz*. This city is located between the اِیلا and Yawıncı rivers' (Kâş. 41).

'*Āk Terek* is the name of a crossing on the اِیلا river at Yağma' (Kâş. 53).

'[The Khan] goes hunting. He orders wild animals to be cornered at the اِیلا valley -which has a great river-' (Kâş. 174).

'The people of the اِیلا river, meaning the Yağmas, Toxsıs, and Çigils, call wine *kızıl süçig*, which means 'red wine' (Kâş. 205).

Kâşgarlı Mahmud exemplifies the word *kémi* as ship with the poem below, in which اِیلا also occurs:

1 Seeing as the word in question is written as اِیلا or اِیلا everywhere, it is impossible to explain how B. Atalay read it as '*il*'.

2 A. Egevbayev (1986) read '*İla attı kisi*' in couplet 841, as '*İla begi*' in couplet 1779, as '*İla ulı*' in couplet 2319, as '*İla ulı*' in couplet 2696, and as '*İla erkini*' in couplet 4752 while preferring to translate couplet 1629 using the word *bođun* in place of the word in question in the B copy.

3 'River's name. Two Turkish clans descend on its two shores: Yağma and Toxsı. And part of Çigil. It is the Ceyhun of the Turkish realm' (Kâş. 58).



'kemi içre oldurup
 ʎ! suwın keçtimiz
 Uygur tapa başlanıp
 Mıñlak élin açtımız' (Kâş. 549)⁴

'We came aboard the ship and crossed the *İle* river. We headed towards Uyghurs and conquered the land of Mıñlak.'

The river Kâşgarlı Mahmud refers to is the river flowing through present-day Kazakhstan and the western parts of the Xinjiang Uyghur Autonomous Region in Central Asia, known as the *İli* or *İle*.

Before moving on to the question of whether the name of this river occurs in *Kutadgu Bilig*, I should state that no valid basis exists for the word written in *Divânu Lugâti't-Türk* as إيلا or لا (which corresponds to *İle* in Kazakh and *Yili he* 伊犁河 in Chinese today) to be read as *Ila* in *Divânu Lugâti't-Türk* instead of *İle*. This misreading should be amended to *İle*.

THE WORD READ AS ILA IN KUTADGU BILIG

R. R. Arat, the editor of the first critical edition of the *Kutadgu Bilig*, pointed out that this work refers by name to certain people from diverse social classes and conveys their opinions on various subjects. He adds that these are no doubt famous people who are either contemporaries of the poet and well-known for their works or are those who make appearances in these kinds of works for similar reasons (e.g., relatively well-explained figures like *ıla atlıgı*, *ıla begi*, *il kend begi*, *uluğ kend begi*, and *yagma begi* [1947: XXVII]). He read and interpreted the couplets in which these words occur as shown below. However, no subordinate phrase established in the form of '*ıla begi*' should be noted here as not being present in *Kutadgu Bilig* (see couplet 1779).

Couplet 841: '*negü tir eşitgil ıla atlıgı / tapugun beđümiş kişi kutluğı*' (Arat 1947: 101)

'Hear what the mighty personage of Ila country, who prospered and gained fame by serving, have to say.' (Arat 1959: 71)

Couplet 1629: '*ıdı yakşı aymış ıla atlıgı / buđunda beđüki kişi kutluğı*' (Arat 1947: 180)

'The famous personage of Ila, who is [the] great[est] and [most] blessed of people, had spoken very aptly.' (Arat 1959: 126)

Couplet 1779: '*negü tir eşitgil ıla beg sözi / sözi ma'nisi ol sözüñke tözi*' (Arat 1947: 195)

'Hear what the bey of Ila says; let its meaning form the basis of your words.' (Arat 1959: 136)

Couplet 2319: '*negü tir eşitgil ıla atlıgı / tuz etmek kiyüt ay kişi kutluğı*' (Arat 1947: 246)

'Hear what the famous personage of Ila says; o [the most] blessed of people, may you have plenty of salt and bread.' (Arat 1959: 173)

Couplet 2696: '*negü tir eşitgil ıla sır teni / ıdı eđgü yañ bu bitig söz yañı*' (Arat 1947: 282)

'Hear what the scribe of Ila says; the way of the written word is a perfect way.' (Arat 1959: 199)

Couplet 4752: '*negü tir eşitgil ıla erkini / tapugçı törüsin ayur kör ani*' (Arat 1947: 475)

'Hear, what the elder of Ila says about the manner and customs of servitude.' (Arat 1959: 343)

⁴ A. Egevbayev (1986) read '*Ila attı kisi*' in couplet 841, as '*Ila begi*' in couplet 1779, as '*Ila ulı*' in couplet 2319, as '*Ila ulı*' in couplet 2696, and as '*Ila erkini*' in couplet 4752 while preferring to translate couplet 1629 using the word *bođun* in place of the word in question in the B copy.



The word Arat reads as *'Ila'* has been interpreted as 'Ila country' in the index of the *Kutadgu Bilig* published posthumously by his students, even though it is the name of a river (Arat 1979: 182).

Radloff, who worked on *Kutadgu Bilig* long before Arat, had read the word that Arat read as *'ila'* in six places, in several different ways:

Couplet 841: *'Negü ter eşitkil el(d)e atlıgı, / Tabuñın pazumas kişi kutluğı'*

'Höre, wie da spricht der beim Volke Berühmte,

Der im Dienste nicht nachlässt, der Glückliche der Menschen.' (Radloff 1900: 79)

Couplet 1629: *'Edi yakşı aymış el(d)e atlıgı, / Pudun pediği ol kişi kutluğı'*

'Sehr gut hat gesprochen der Berühmte des Volkes,

Der Hohe des Volkes ist der glücklichste der Menschen.' (Radloff 1900: 149)

Couplet 1779: *'Negü ter eşitkil ile pek sözi, / Sösnüng ma'nızı ol sözüñge tözi'*

'Höre, wie da spricht das Wort des verständigen Fürsten,

Die Bedeutung des Wortes dient deinem Worte zur Grundlage.' (Radloff 1900: 162)

Couplet 2319: *'Negü ter eşitkil hile atlıgı, / Tus etmek keñ kördü kişi kutluğı'*

'Höre, wie da spricht der durch Schlaueit Berühmte, [schen:]

Der viel Salz und Brot gesehen hat, der Glückliche der Men-' (Radloff 1900: 206)

Couplet 2696: *'Negü ter eşitkil tileser (?) tegi: / "Edi etkü neñ pu pidig söş teni!"'*

'Höre, wie da spricht der Nachkomme, der.....:

Eine gute Sache ist das Maass der Schriftworte!' (Radloff 1910: 236)

Couplet 4752: *'Negü ter eşitkil el-e erkini, / Tabukçı törüzin ayur öz köni'*

'Höre, wie da spricht der El Erkin,

"Der selbst die Regeln des Dienenden richtig darstellt." (Radloff 1910: 403)

Clauson offers couplet 4752 from *Kutadgu Bilig* as an example in the *'irkin'* entry and espouses Arat's reading, as well, regarding the word in question: *'negü tér eşitgil Ila irkini'* 'hear what the *irkin* of Ila has to say' (Clauson 1972: 225).

R. Dankoff (1983) reads the word which occurs in these couplets as *'ila'*: 'the chief of the Ili...' (p. 67), 'the glorious chief of the Ili' (p. 93), 'the prince of Ili' (p. 98), 'the chief of Ili Valley' (p. 116), 'the Sir Tengi of the Ili' (p. 128), 'the Irkin of Ili' (p. 195). However, apart from R. Dankoff's interpretations on pages 67, 93, 116, 128, and 195, no expression is available in *Kutadgu Bilig* that would be interpreted in the form of 'the prince of Ili': ابلال سوزی (B: 137), ابلال سوزی (C: 87). As can be seen in my reading of couplet 1779 later on, this expression can only be interpreted as *ayla beg sözi*.

R. Dankoff (1983: 17) also quotes couplet 4752 and its continuation among the examples of Sufism from the text: '(attributed to the Irkin of Ila!): on serving a prince. Sufyan al-Thawri: "Do not keep company with the Sultan. If you are obedient, he will overburden you; and if you are disobedient, he will kill you."'

In other editions of *Kutadgu Bilig*, the word appears as *ila* or *ila*. Egevbayev (1986: 123, 200, 243, 273, 442) *'ila'*, Vəliyev and Əskər (2006: 80, 131, 140, 172, 194, 318), and Tohliyev (1990: 169) read this as *'ila'*, while T. Kozubekov (1993) read this as *'ila'* and also stated that *'ile'* is another option.⁵

⁵ While Kozubekov (1993) noted that it may also be read as *'ile'*, he invariably translated it as *'ila'*: He translated part of couplet 841 as *'ilaluk bir kişinin'* and explained in a footnote that *'Ila* was the name of a clan or a place of that time'. He also translated the following forms of *ila*: *'Ilanın bir begi'* in couplet 1779, *'ilaluk bir adam'* in couplet 2319, *'ilaluk adam'* in couplet 2696, and *'ilaluk bir adam'* in couplet 4752. He preferred translating using the word *bođun* in couplet 1629, which appears in place of the word in question in the B copy.



Kutadgu Bilig has no compounds forming the names of a city, region, mountain, or river such as ... *atlığı*, ... *beg*, ... *sır teñi*, or ... *irkini*. Furthermore, the work contains the names of rulers, prophets, caliphs, countries, regions, cities, tribes, and clans but no one who is associated with the names of rivers, mountains, streams, lakes, or seas.

Kâşgarlı Mahmud stated that Yağmas and Tohsis and some Çigils inhabit both sides of this river; in fact, *Yagma begi* is found in two couplets of *Kutadgu Bilig* (see couplets 1758 and 4947).⁶ Meanwhile, Çigil appears in two couplets as *biliglig Çigil* (3491) and *biligsiz Çigil* (4448).⁷

I argue that the word Arat read as *ıla* and associated with a river's name has nothing to do with the river. The word in question should be read as *ayla* and translated accordingly.

We encounter *ayla* for the first time in *Dîvânu Lugâti't-Türk*. Kâşgarlı Mahmud stated that '*ayla*' means 'so' in the Oghuz language, while the phrase '*ayla kıl*' means 'do so' (Kâş. 69), and '*aylok aylok*' corresponds to 'thus and so' in the Oghuz language (Kâş. 69). Kâşgarlı Mahmud also included this proposition in the sentences '*men ayla osdum*' (Kâş. 93) and '*ol añar ayla buyurdi*' (Kâş. 526). Clauson (1972: 272) called this a hapax legomenon, but Ercilasun confuted this argument with '*ëylä:k*' which means 'the word that indicates side and direction, hither and thither in Turkmen' (Ercilasun and Akkoyunlu 2015: 55).

This proposition, which is found today as *eġ* in Azerbaijani Turkish, *öyle* in Turkish, *olay* in Kazakh, and *alayı* in Kirghiz occurs six times throughout *Kutadgu Bilig*.

Couplet 841:

A 34: *nëgü ter eşitgin ayla atlığı / tapugın basumaz kişi kutluğu*

ننگو تر عيتگين ايلا اتلغى / تاپوگن باسوماز كيشي كوتلغى

B 70: *nëgü tér eşitgil ayla athığı / tapugun beđümiş kişi kutluğu*

ننگو تر عيتگيل ايلا اتلغى / تاپوگون بدؤميش كيشي كوتلغى

Taking the features of the copies into account, this couplet can be constructed as follows:

nëgü tér eşitgil ayla athığı / tapugun beđümiş kişi kutluğu

The couplet preceding the one above, couplet 840 in which Ay Toldı asks Kün Togdı how he should serve him, is as follows: 'No amount of suffering is of use, if the service is not as the bey desires.' Couplets 842 to 845, on the other hand, relay what the blessed person has to say about the matter at hand.

In this case, 841st couplet should be translated as such: 'Hear what the blessed person (who has *kut*) whose name and reputation have been exalted so by serving [his country, his khan]'

Couplet 1629:

A 64: *edi yakşı aymış ayla athığı / bodun beđüki ol kişi kutluğu*

ئدي ياكشى ايميش ايلا اتلغى / بؤدؤن بدؤكي اول كيشي كوتلغى

⁶ 1758: *iđi yakşı aymış bu yagma begi* (B 135); 4947: *nëgü tér eşit yakşı yagma begi* (B 356).

⁷ 3491: *nëgü tér eşitgil biliglig çigil* (B 256); 4448: *basınan bolurlar biligsiz çigil* (B 320).



B 127: *iđi yaqşı aymış bođun atlıđı / bođunda talusı kiři kutluđı*

اڭى بېشى ايمىز نوزدرب ايلغى بوزوزدا تالوسى كىشى قوتلوتى

C 77: *iđi yaqşı aymış ayla atlıđı / bodunda bedüki kiři kutluđı*

ايدى تىختى ايميش ايلات ايلغى بودوندا بدوكى كىشى قوتلوتى

Taking the features of the copies into account, this couplet can be constructed as follows:

iđi yaqşı aymış ayla atlıđı / bođunda bedüki kiři kutluđı

This couplet is found at the point narrating Ögdülmiş's entry into the service of Kün Togdı. Previous two couplets are related to Kün Togdı's thoughts about Ögdülmiş: Couplet 1627 is 'I should raise him so that he grows into a man, a man is always useful,' and couplet 1628 is 'I see that he will be of use and flourish, he has no flaws but his young age.' (1628). Couplets 1630 to 1632, in turn, relay the words of the blessed (i.e., kutlu) person.

In this case, couplet 1629 should be translated as 'The one who is named as [the] great[est] and [most] blessed (i.e., one who has the most kut) of people had spoken truly.'

Couplet 1779:

A 68: *negü ter yeşitgil ayna beg sözi / söziñ ma'nisi ol söziñke tözi*

سوزى نىر يەشيتگىل اينا بەگ سۆزى سۆزىنىڭ مەنىسى ئول سۆزىڭگە تۆزى

B 137: *negü tér eşit bu ayla beg sözi / sözi ma'nisi ol biligsiz közi*

نەگۈ تەر ەشيت بۇ ايلدا بەگ سۆزى سۆزىنىڭ مەنىسى ئول بىلگىسىز كۆزى

C 87: *negü tér eşitgil ayla beg sözi / söziñ ma'nisi ol söziñke tözi*

نەگۈ تەر ەشيتگىل ايلدا بەگ سۆزى سۆزىنىڭ مەنىسى ئول سۆزىڭگە تۆزى

Taking the features of the copies into account, this couplet can be constructed as follows:

negü tér eşitgil ayla beg sözi / sözi ma'nisi ol söziñke tözi

This couplet occurs at the point narrating Ögdülmiş's entry into the ruler's service. Couplet 1775 is 'Such benefits come from knowledge; from the smart, knowledgeable, and good-natured man,' couplet 1776 is 'How can the smart person not be praised, how can the fool not be spoken ill of,' couplet 1777 is 'The smart one's deeds are always measured, the knowledgeable one's deeds are always apparent,' and couplet 1778 is 'Believe, how well kut suits the smart or the knowledgeable who behave well.'

Considering the previous couplets, couplet 1779 should be translated as:

'Hear what such a bey says, let its meaning form the basis of your words.'

Couplet 2319:

A 86: *negü ter eşitgil ayla atlıđı / tuz etmek kengürt ay kiři kutluđı*

نەگۈ تەر ەشيتگىل ايلدا اتلىڭى تۇز ەتمەك كەنگۈرت ايدا كىرى كۈتۈلۈڭى



B 175: *négü tér eşitgil ayla atlıgı / tuz etmek kénüt ay kişi kutlugı*

نکوتیرایشکیل ایلا اتلیغی نوزاتمال کینکوت ای کئی فورتاوی

C 124: *négü tér eşitgil ayla atlıgı / tuz ötmek kénüt ay kişi kutlugı*

مکوتیرایشکیل ایلا اتلیغی نوزاتمال کینکوت ای کئی فورتاوی

Taking the features of the copies into account, couplet 2319 can be constructed as follows:

négü tér eşitgil ayla atlıgı / tuz etmek kénüt ay kişi kutlugı

This couplet occurs at the point where Ögdülmiş tells the ruler how a commander should be. Because couplet 2318 reads, ‘Food, drink, salt-and-bread spread one’s name, the remedy of this life is food and drink,’ couplet 2319 should be translated as:

‘O the [most] blessed (one who has the most kuts) of people, hear what one who acquires fame so says, ensure that salt-and-bread are plenty.’

Couplet 2696:

A 97: *negü ter eşitgil tile ser tegi / Edi edgü neñ bu bitig söz teni*

نە بۇ بیتیک سۆز تەنی ئەدگۈ نەن بۇ بیتیک سۆز تەنی

B 200: *négü tér eşitgil ayla sır teni / idi edgü yan bu bitig söz yanı*

بیتیکیرایشکیل ایلا سرتینکی اینکی اذکونیک بوتیک سورتینکی

C 150: -

Taking the features of the copies into account, couplet 2696 should be constructed as follows:

négü tér eşitgil ayla sır teni / idi edgü yan bu bitig söz yanı

This couplet occurs at the point where Ögdülmiş tells the ruler how a scribe should be. Couplet 2693 reads, ‘The scribe should be knowledgeable and smart, and possess beautiful calligraphy and outstanding rhetoric,’ couplet 2694 is ‘If a letter’s calligraphy is beautiful, the heart is enlivened; one wants to read when one sees it, the heart is consoled,’ and couplet 2695 goes, ‘If the beauty of the calligraphy gets combined with rhetoric, the written word assumes perfect expression.’ In this case, couplet 2696 should be translated as follows:

‘Hear what such a scribe says, [as his] way of writing down is a perfect way.’

Couplet 4752:

A 134: *negü ter eşitgil ayla erkini / tapugçı törüsin ayur öz köni*

تە بۇ بیتیک سۆز تەنی ئەدگۈ نەن بۇ بیتیک سۆز تەنی

B 342: *négü tér eşitgil ayla irkini / tapugçı törüsin ayur kör anı*

نکوتیرایشکیل ایلا ایرکینی تپوخی توروسین ایور کوزا بی



C 281: *négü tér eşitgil ayla irkini / tapuççı törüsin ayur kör anı*

سکوتراشدکد املا از کتی توغخی توروسین ایور کوز ایینه

Considering the copies, the couplet should be constructed as follows:

*négü tér eşitgil ayla irkini*⁸ / *tapuççı törüsin ayur kör anı*

This couplet occurs at the point where Ogdurmuş tells Ögdülmiş that he has turned away from the world and contented himself with what is at hand. Considering how couplet 4749 reads as ‘For this, one should sometimes go hungry, sometimes satiated; the servant should bear his burden if the bey gets comfortable,’ couplet 4750 is ‘If his service is not appreciated, a whole life has unfortunately been wasted,’ couplet 4751 goes ‘Tell, what the servant gains, what pleasure is there in this service of his,’ and thus couplet 4752 should be translated as:

‘Hear what one who is so great says about the customs of service.’

THE COUPLETS’ METER

Yûsuf Hâs Hâcib used the *mütekârib* meter, which uses the pattern of *feûlün feûlün feûlün feûl*, successfully in his work. Furthermore, he managed this feat with Turkish words, unlike later poets who exceedingly integrated Arabic and Persian into their poems. Hâcib also brought together the Turkish syllabic meter with the *aruz* meter. *Kutadgu Bilig*’s meter conforms to the syllabic meter’s pattern of 11 syllables at 6+5 intervals alongside the 7+4 and 5+6 intervals. Therefore, hundreds of couplets in the work appear to have been delivered in the syllabic meter using the 6+5 interval. As this cannot be claimed to be a coincidence, one should bear in mind that, while Hâcib wrote his work using the *aruz* meter, he also took the intervals of the syllabic meter into account, making the effect and harmony of the syllabic meter distinctly apparent in parallel with the rhythm of *aruz* meter (Dilçin 2009: 131).

Then the question becomes whether or not the reading of *ayla* in the couplets that have been deliberated upon above breaks the meter; *y* is a half-vowel and likely used by Hâcib as an element of harmony. Indeed, the exclamation, *ay* must have been used for the same purpose in *Kutadgu Bilig*. A. Ateş (1949: 162) argued that, because no lines are found in *Kutadgu Bilig* that start with a closed syllable apart from the lines that start with the exclamation *ay* or the closed syllables that precede a word starting with a vowel, the exclamation Hâcib used hundreds of times where an open syllable should be found according to the meter needs to be read as *i*. Prevailing interpretation, too, is thus, in any case. Nonetheless, ruling out the *y* in this exclamation without considering the properties of the *y* sound in a poem written according to the *aruz* meter cannot be considered an acceptable approach.

The *aruz* meter first appeared as an element of harmony belonging to Arabic poetry. Following its long-term use, it was systematized based on the linguistic structure of Arabic and became bound by a certain set of principles. Meanwhile, the Persian form of the *aruz* meter was created when the rules of *aruz* were revised based on the linguistic structure of Persian during its appli-

⁸ The word which R. R. Arat (1979: 157) reads as ‘*erkini*’ is placed under the entry for ‘*erk*’ in the index. A separate entry for ‘*irkin*’ should be created.



cation to Persian poetry (Düzenli and Bulak 2018: 167). Ordinarily, poets would have followed a variety of methods in adapting the *aruz* meter to Turkish poetry and would have made certain decisions concerning spelling and pronunciation to overcome the difficulties faced while applying the *aruz* meter they had taken from Persian literature to their own poetry.⁹ However, because no theories could be formed in applying *aruz* befitting the linguistic structure of Turkish, these remained as individual attempts by each poet.

As such, the alleged meter defects in Hâcib's work should be reevaluated from this perspective. His work proved Hâcib's artistry and mastery of the meter. What we consider as meter defects today were probably not considered as such at that time. When claiming he was inexperienced in applying *aruz* to Turkish poetry, one should not ignore that Hâcib produced a magnificent work, ensured the formation of classical Turkish poetry through his work's incorporation of diverse literary genres, and significantly contributed to the cultural development of Central Asian Turks.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- ABBAS, Abdusalam and et al. 1981-1984. *Mehmud Keşkerî, Türki Tillar Divanı* [Mahmûd al-Kâşgarî, Divan of the Turkic Languages]. I-III. Ürümçi: Şincan Halk Neşriyatı.
- ARAT, Reşid Rahmeti 1947. *Kutadgu Bilig: Metin* [Kutadgu Bilig: Text]. I. Ankara: Türk Dil Kurumu.
- ARAT, Reşid Rahmeti 1959. *Kutadgu Bilig: Çeviri* [Kutadgu Bilig: Translation]. II. Ankara: Türk Tarih Kurumu.
- ARAT, Reşid Rahmeti 1979. *Kutadgu Bilig: İndeks* [Kutadgu Bilig: Index]. III. Eds. Kemal Eraslan, Osman F. Sertkaya and Nuri Yüce. İstanbul: Türk Kültürünü Araştırma Enstitüsü.
- ATALAY, Besim 1985. *Divanü Lûgat-it-Türk Tercümesi* [The Translation of Divân Lugât at-Türk]. I-III. Ankara: Türk Dil Kurumu.
- ATALAY, Besim 1986. *Divanü Lûgat-it-Türk Dizini 'Endeks'* [The Index of Divân Lugât at-Türk]. Ankara: Türk Dil Kurumu.
- ATEŞ, Ahmet 1949. '[Yusuf Hâs Hâcib] Kutadgu Bilig. [Editor] Reşid Rahmeti Arat. İstanbul 1947 = T.D.K. yayınlarından, c. II, 29.' *Türk Tarih Kurumu Belleten XIII/49*: 157–163.
- AVEZOV, A. M. [Авезовой, А. М.] (trans., foreword and commentary) 2005. *Махмуд ал-Кашғари, Диван Лугат ат-Турк*. Indexes P. Эрмерсом. Алматы: Дайк-Пресс.
- CANPOLAT, Mustafa 1995. *Ömer Bin Mezîd, Mecmû'atü'n-Nezâ'ir: Metin-Dizin-Tıpkıbasım* ['Omar Bin Mazîd, Majmû'at al-Nazâ'ir: Text-Index-Facsimile]. Ankara: Türk Dil Kurumu.
- CLAUSON, Gerard 1972. *An Etymological Dictionary of Pre-Thirteenth Century Turkish*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- DANKOFF, Robert 1983. *Wisdom of Royal Glory (Kutadgu Bilig). A Turko-Islamic Mirror for Princes*. Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press.
- DANKOFF, Robert and James KELLY (eds.) 1982-1985. *Mahmûd al-Kâşgarî. Compendium of the Turkic Dialects (Divân Lugât at-Türk)*. I-III. Washington: Harvard University Printing Office.

⁹ Mustafa Canpolat (1995: 254) notes that all of the poets in 'Ömer Bin Mezîd's *Mecmû'atü'n-Nezâ'ir*'s had attached great importance to liaisons with haplogy, and had considered these liaisons not defects but indications of mastery, and had not avoided haplogy even when they could; namely the poets of this period used liaisons consciously and willingly.



- DILÇIN, Cem 2009. 'XI. Yüzyıl Türk Şiiri ve Aruz [XI. Century Turkish Poetry and the Aruz Meter]'. In: Ülkü Çelik Şavk, Fatma Türkyılmaz, Mikail Cengiz (eds.) II. *Uluslararası Türkiyat Araştırmaları Bilgi Şöleni Bildirileri, Kâşgarlı Mahmud ve Dönemi, 28-30 May 2008*. Ankara: Türk Dil Kurumu, 129–140.
- DÜZENLİ, Mesut Bayram and Şahap BULAK 2018. 'Aruz Vezninin Türk Şiirine Tatbikinde Başvurulan İmlâ/ Telaffuz Tasarrufları ve Mahiyetleri [Spelling/ Pronunciation Methods and Qualities Used in the Application of Aruz Meter to Turkish Poetry]'. *Selçuk Üniversitesi Türkiyat Araştırmaları Dergisi* 43: 145–171.
- EGEVBAEV, Askar [Kurmaşılı] [Ереубаев, Асқар [Құрмащұлы]] (trans., foreword and commentary) 1986. *Жүсін Баласағұн, Құтты билік [Yüsuf Khâss Hâjib, Blessed Knowledge]*. Алматы: Жазушы.
- EGEVBAEV, Askar [Kurmaşılı] [Ереубаев, Асқар [Құрмащұлы]] (trans., foreword and commentary) 1997–1998. *Махмұт Қашқари, Түрик Сөздігі [Mahmūd al-Kâşgarī, Turkic Dictionary]*. I–III. Алматы: ХАНТ.
- ERCILASUN, Ahmet Bican and Ziyat AKKOYUNLU (eds.) 2015. *Kâşgarlı Mahmud Divânu Lugâti't-Türk: Giriş-Metin-Çeviri-Notlar-Dizin [Kâşgarlı Mahmud Divân Lugât at-Turk: Introduction-Text-Translation-Notes-Index]*. 2nd ed. Ankara: Türk Dil Kurumu.
- ӨСКӘР, Ramiz (ed.) 2006. *Mahmud Kaşğari, Divanü Lüğat-it-Türk*. I. Bakı: Azərbaycan Milli Elmler Akademiyası.
- HAS HÂCİB, Yusuf 2015. *İslâmî Dönem Türk Edebiyatının İlk Eseri Kutadgu Bilig. Tıpkıbasım. Kahire Nüshası [The First Work of Islamic Period Turkish Literature Kutadgu Bilig. Facsimile. Cairo copy]*. Eds. Emek Üşenmez and Erdem Uçar. İstanbul: Akademik Kitaplar.
- HAS HÂCİB, Yusuf 2014. *İslâmî Dönem Türk Edebiyatının İlk Eseri Kutadgu Bilig. Tıpkıbasım. Herat (Vienna-Avusturya) Nüshası [The First Work of Islamic Period Turkish Literature Kutadgu Bilig. Facsimile. Herat (Vienna-Austria) copy]*. Ed. Emek Üşenmez. İstanbul: Akademik Kitaplar.
- HAS HÂCİB, Yusuf 2013. *Kutadgu Bilig. Tıpkıbasım [Facsimile]. Nemengan/Özbekistan Fergana Nüshası [Kutadgu Bilig. Facsimile. Namangan/Uzbekistan/Fergana copy]*. Ed. Emek Üşenmez. İstanbul: Akademik Kitaplar.
- [Kâşgarlı Mahmud] 1941. *Divanü Lüğat-it-Türk Tıpkıbasımı "Faksimile"* [The Facsimile of Divân Lugât at-Turk]. Ankara: Türk Dil Kurumu.
- KONOHOV, A. N. [Кононов, А. Н.] (ed.) 1983. *Баласагунский Юсуф, Благодатное знание*. [Trans. Сергея Иванова.] Москва: Наука.
- KOZUBEKOV, T. [Козубеков, Т.] (trans.) 1993. *Қуттуу билим, Жусуп Баласагын: Дастан [Blessed Knowledge, Yüsuf Khâss Hâjib: Epic]*. 2nd ed. Москва: Ник.
- RADLOFF, W. 1898. 'Über eine in Kairo aufgefundene zweite Handschrift des Kutadku Bilik'. *Извѣстія Императорской Академіи Наукъ (Bulletin de l'Académie Impériale des Sciences de St. Pétersbourg)*, IX/4: 309–319.
- RADLOFF, Wilhelm 1900. *Das Kudatku Bilik des Jusuf Chass-Hadschib aus Bälasagun. II. Text und Übersetzung nach den Handschriften von Wien und Kairo, I. Lieferung: pp. 2-95 der Wiener Handschrift*. St. Petersburg.
- RADLOFF, Wilhelm 1910. *Das Kudatku Bilik des Jusuf Chass-Hadschib aus Bälasagun. II. Text und Übersetzung nach den Handschriften von Wien und Kairo, II. Lieferung: pp. 96-185 der Wiener Handschrift*. St. Petersburg.
- TEKIN, Talât 1989. *XI. Yüzyıl Türk Şiiri [XI. Century Turkish Poetry]*. Ankara: Türk Dil Kurumu.



- ТОНЛИЙЕВ, Bakican [Тўхлиев, Боқижон] (trans. and foreword) 1990. *Юсуф Хос Хожиб. Кутадгу Билиз, Саодатга Бошловчи Билим* [Yūsuf Khāss Hājib. Kutadgu Bilig, Knowledge That Leads to Happiness]. Eds. Усмон Қўчқор, Чори Аваз. Тошкент: Юлдузча.
- VÁMBÉRY, Hermann 1870. *Uigurische Sprachdenkmäler und das Kudatku Bilik. Uigurischer Text mit Transcription und Übersetzung nebst einem uigurisch-deutschen Wörterbuch und lithographierten Facsimile aus dem Originaltext des Kudatku Bilik*. Innsbruck: Wagner'schen Universitäts-Buchdruckerei.
- VƏLİYEV, Kamil and Ramiz ƏSKƏR 2006. *Yusif Balasaqunlu. Xoşbəxtliyə Aparan Elm Qutadğu Bilig* [Yūsuf Khāss Hājib. Knowledge That Leads to Happiness Kutadgu Bilig]. Bakı: Avrasiya Press.

