

PROCEEDINGS OF THE 1ST INTERNATIONAL  
CONFERENCE ON THE ROLE OF RELIGIONS IN THE  
TURKIC CULTURE HELD ON SEPTEMBER 9–11, 2015 IN  
BUDAPEST

EDITED BY

MÁRIA IVANICS  
ÉVA CSÁKI  
ZSUZSANNA OLACH

BUDAPEST  
2016

# KARAIM TRANSLATIONS OF THE SONG OF MOSES AS SOURCES OF KARAITE RELIGIOUS CONCEPTS

ZSUZSANNA OLACH\*

MTA-SZTE Turkological Research Group – University of Szeged  
e-mail: zsuzsanna.olach@gmail.com

## Abstract

As followers of Karaism, the Turkic-speaking Karaim communities have always placed great value in translations of the Hebrew Bible into Karaim (Zajaczkowski 1980). Although the translation methods used by the Karaim were generally standardized, differences can be observed to varying degrees (Olach 2013; Zajaczkowski 1932b, 1934). For example, Karaim translations of the Song of Moses (Deut. 32) differ from each other significantly in some points. Some of the variations are based on lexical differences between Karaim varieties. In some cases, a translation deviates from others in the use of tenses, case markers, etc. Thus, the differences might be grammatical. Another type of difference will be, however the topic of the present study: additions found in Karaim versions of the Song. The Karaim translations of the Song of Moses contain numerous additions which do not correspond to the original Hebrew text. These additions are similar to those found in Karaite-Arabic translations of the Hebrew Bible (Polliack 1997). Therefore, Polliack's classification of additions will be used as the theoretic frame. Textually Interpretive Additions will be briefly discussed, whereas Theologically Interpretive Additions, such as the addition *bulutu bila* 'with his cloud' in Deut. 32: 10 *kursa:di ani bulut:u bila* [surround:DI.PST3SG he:ACC cloud:POSS3SG with] 'He (i.e. God) surrounded him with his cloud', will be in the focus of the present paper.

Keywords: Karaim, Bible translation, Karaim Creed, Textually Interpretive Additions, Theologically Interpretive Additions

## Introduction

Among the Turkic speaking people there exist a group of people in Eastern Europe (mainly in present-day Lithuania, Poland, Ukraine and Russia) who are different from the great mass as for their religion since they are followers of Karaite Judaism. Karaite Judaism is based on the Hebrew Bible and rejects the post biblical traditions, i.e. the Mishna, the Talmud, etc. (Nemoy 1978, 603–604). Thus the Old Testament plays a significant role in their religious life.

In order to help the members of Karaim communities, Karaim had started to translate biblical texts from Hebrew to Karaim rather early. They used a special method for the translations: the translators aimed to render the sacred texts in the most accurate manner (Zajaczkowski 1980, 161–162). This translational method resulted in Karaim texts reflecting numerous characteristics of Biblical Hebrew, e.g. the word order properties, the special functions of interrogative pronouns, the use of the demonstrative pronouns as translational equivalents of the Hebrew definite article and the Hebrew direct object marker (Olach 2013).

---

\* The present paper submits some of the findings of the on-going project 'The Jewish culture and its literature among Karaim. The Song of Moses' which has been supported by the János Bolyai Research Scholarship of the Hungarian Academy of Sciences.

Despite the special translational method, additions can be found in the Karaim Bible translations. The question arises here: why do these additions occur in the Karaim Bible translations? What do they tell us? Do they provide any information about the religion of the Karaim?

In this paper, additions found in the Song of Moses, that is the 1–43 lines in the 32nd chapter of the Book of Deuteronomy will be discussed. In the Song, Moses talks to the people of Israel and tells them how unfaithful they have been towards God who lead them through the wilderness to a rich land. Their unfaithfulness made God to be inclined to threaten them. At the end, however, God promises forgiveness and help to the people of Israel and the demolition of their enemies.

Although, several parts of the Karaim Bible translations have been published until the present day, there are not many verses and chapters of the Hebrew Bible available in all the Karaim varieties. Basically, only the first few chapters of the Genesis in different Karaim varieties have been published by different authors so far.<sup>1</sup> The Song of Moses in all the Karaim varieties provides the basis for this comparative study.

### **Karaim versions of the Song of Moses**

A Crimean Karaim translation (marked as CrM in the followings) published by Jankowski was used for the present study. This translation was assumedly composed on the basis of a translation „made no later than the beginning of the eighteenth century” (Jankowski 1997, 2). The text can be found on the following lines and pages in the manuscript: 243a (17)–244b (11) (Jankowski 1997, 43–49). The manuscript of this translation is kept in the Rylands Library, Manchester (England). Another Crimean Karaim version, namely the Gözleve Bible (marked as CrG in the followings) published in four volumes in 1841 in Gözleve (today Eupatoria) on the occasion of the wedding of the future Russian Tsar Alexander II. was used as well (Shapira 2003, 696). This translation was most probably compiled from various manuscripts (Jankowski 2009, 508). The text can be found on the following pages of the book: 380–382.

A Trakai Karaim version (denoted as TF in the followings) published by Mykolas Firkovičius, the late *hazzan* of the Trakai Karaim community (1924–2000) was also examined. The text occurs on the pages 65–69 in the book *Karaj diñlilarniñ jalbarmach jergialiari. I bitik. Ochumach üčiuñ kieniesada*. (The order of prayers for Karaim believers. 1. book. For reading in the house of prayer.) (Firkovičius 1998). Unfortunately Firkovičius says nothing about the manuscript he used for his publication. Thus we know nothing about the date or the author of this Trakai Karaim version.

The Halich Karaim version (denoted as HA in the followings) used for the presentation is part of the family Bible of the family Abrahamowicz who originally lived in Halich (Ukraine). This version is a so far unpublished biblical text in the Halich Karaim variety. Unfortunately no information is given in the book about the author or the date of the translation.

### **Additions**

For the classification of the additions, a system based on Polliack’s description of additions occurred in Arabic Karaite Bible translations was used. According to Polliack, „additions function as hallmarks which distinguish translation features primarily concerned with cohesion from those concerned with syntax and lexicon” (Polliack 1997, 209). It means, that

---

<sup>1</sup> On the published Karaim Bible translations, see Olach 2013, 7–10.

in the case of additions, no correleation can be attested since no grammatical or lexical element of the source language is represented by a grammatical or lexical equivalent of the target language. Additions are „the translator’s reader-response to the source text and his interpretation of its meaning as a cohesive unit which generate the use of additions” in the target language (Polliack 1997, 209).

Polliack distinguishes four different types of additions:

- textually interpretive additions: „which are formed in response to different types of ellipsis in the biblical source text”
- theologically interpretive additions: „formed in response to extra-textual concerns of the translator”
- referential links: „generate cohesive ties with previous or following verses of the translated text”
- temporal links: „forge ties in the translated text in response to an inverted order of events in the source text” (Polliack 1997, 211).

The present analysis focuses on the textually interpretive additions and theologically interpretive additions. For the discussion on the referential links and the temporal links, see Olach’s study (forthcoming). The additions will be underlined in the examples.

### Textually interpretive additions

Difficult grammatical structures of a biblical verse sometimes result in a textually interpretive addition which can be a single word, a phrase or a clause. Those additions which provide complements of the verb or the nouns in a biblical verse „clarifying the core meaning of the biblical sentence” are called nuclear additions (Polliack 1997, 212). More extensive additions, such as phrases and clauses, i.e. the non-nuclear additions clarify „the immediate context of the biblical verse and [...] restore a logical sequence in the narrative plot” (Polliack 1997, 212).

#### *Textually interpretive additions – Nuclear additions*

Nuclear complements of verbs / Verb completed by a subject

In v. 6, an addition in the Halich Karaim translation can be attested. In the final clause, the subject is not overt in the Crimean Karaim and the Trakai Karaim translations, because its subject is identical with the subject of the first clause, i.e. ‘your father’. In the Halich Karaim version, however, the word *yisra’el* ‘God’ is added to the Karaim text, thus the verb *tizidi* [establish:DI.PST3SG] ‘he established’ is completed by the subject *yisra’el* ‘God’; see example (1).

(1)

Deut. 32: 6

|    |   |               |                |            |              |                        |
|----|---|---------------|----------------|------------|--------------|------------------------|
| BH | <i>hālōʹ-hūʹ</i>  | <i>ʹābīkā</i> | <i>qqānēkā</i> | <i>hūʹ</i> | <i>ʹāškā</i> | <i>wəyəkōnēkā</i>      |
|    | whether not-<br>he  | your father   | he created you | he         | he made you  | and he established you |
|    | ‘Is not he your father, who created you, who made you and established you?’ |               |                |            |              |                        |

|     |                                     |  |  |   |                                 |                                |                                 |  |                              |  |                                       |                              |
|-----|-------------------------------------|--|--|---|---------------------------------|--------------------------------|---------------------------------|--|------------------------------|--|---------------------------------------|------------------------------|
| CrM | <i>muna</i> <sup>2</sup><br>behold! | <i>ol</i><br>he                                | <i>ataj</i><br>your<br>father                              | <i>yarattī</i><br>he<br>created                   | <i>seni</i><br>you<br>(ACC)     | <i>ol</i><br>he                | <i>yarattī</i><br>he<br>created | <i>seni</i><br>you<br>(ACC)  | <i>da</i><br>and             | <i>tüzidi</i><br>he<br>establi<br>shed | <i>seni</i><br>you<br>(ACC)           |                              |
| CrG | <i>muna</i><br>behold!              | <i>oldir</i><br>he<br>(COP<br>3SG)             | <i>ataj</i><br>your<br>father                              | <i>ki</i><br>who                                  | <i>yarattī</i><br>he<br>created | <i>seni</i><br>you<br>(ACC)    | <i>ol</i><br>he                 | <i>yarattī</i><br>he<br>created  | <i>seni</i><br>you<br>(ACC)  | <i>da</i><br>and                       | <i>tüzidi</i><br>he<br>established    | <i>seni</i><br>you<br>(ACC)  |
| TF  | <i>muna</i><br>behold!              | <i>Ol</i><br>he                                | <i>atey</i><br>your<br><i>s'eni</i> <sup>3</sup><br>father | <i>ki</i><br>who                                  | <i>yarattī</i><br>he<br>created | <i>s'eni</i> ,<br>you<br>(ACC) | <i>Ol</i><br>he                 | <i>yoxtan</i><br>he<br><i>bar</i><br><i>etti</i> <sup>4</sup><br>created | <i>s'eni</i><br>you<br>(ACC) | <i>da</i><br>and                       | <i>t'uz'ud'u</i><br>he<br>established | <i>s'eni</i><br>you<br>(ACC) |
| HA  | <i>muna</i><br>behold!              | <i>oldu</i> <sup>5</sup><br>he<br>(COP<br>3SG) | <i>atan</i><br>your<br><i>senin</i><br>father              | <i>yoktan</i><br>he<br><i>bar etti</i><br>created | <i>seni</i><br>you<br>(ACC)     | <i>ol</i><br>he                | <i>yarattī</i><br>he<br>created | <i>seni</i><br>you<br>(ACC)  | <i>da</i><br>and             | <i>yisra'el</i><br>Israel              | <i>tizidi</i><br>he<br>established    | <i>seni</i><br>you<br>(ACC)  |

### ***Textually interpretive additions – Non-nuclear additions***

Clauses giving background information

The second clause of v. 25 in the Song of Moses reads as follows: ‘and in the chamber terror’. The various Karaim translations are almost identical in respect of this verse, only the phonetic properties of each Karaim variety and their lexicon differentiate them. But in the Halich Karaim translation, an added clause can be attested: *eger astan:sa:lar alar:da* [if be in hiding:HYP3PL they:LOC] ‘if they were hiding in them’; see example (2). The addition provides no valuable extra information.

(2)

Deut. 32:25

|      |   |  |                         |  |                            |                                   |                               |
|------|---|--|-------------------------|--|----------------------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| BH   | <i>ûmēḥāḡārīm</i><br>and at chambers.CONJ.PREP.N:MASC.PL.ABS<br>‘and in the chamber terror’ | <i>ʕēmā<sup>h</sup></i><br>terror.N:FEM.SG.ABS |                         |  |                            |                                   |                               |
| CrM  | <i>da</i><br>and  | <i>hujra:lar:dan</i><br>chamber:PL:ABL         | <i>qorquw</i><br>terror |  |                            |                                   |                               |
| CrG  | <i>da</i><br>and  | <i>urda:lar:dan</i><br>chamber:PL:ABL          | <i>qorquw</i><br>terror |  |                            |                                   |                               |
| CrEB | <i>da</i><br>and  | <i>hujra:lar:dan</i><br>chamber:PL:ABL         | <i>qorquw</i><br>terror |  |                            |                                   |                               |
| TF   | <i>da</i><br>and  | <i>xujura:lar:dan</i><br>chamber:PL:ABL        | <i>qorxuw</i><br>terror |  |                            |                                   |                               |
| HA   | <i>da</i><br>and  | <i>xudzura:lar:dan</i><br>chamber:PL:ABL       | <i>eger</i><br>if       | <i>astran:sa:lar</i><br>be in hiding:HYP:3PL | <i>alar:da</i><br>they:LOC | <i>qorquw:u</i><br>terror:POSS3SG | <i>elet:nin</i><br>plague:GEN |

<sup>2</sup> On the translation of the Hebrew *háló’* construction with *muna* ‘behold!’ into Karaim, see Olach 2013, 165–168.

<sup>3</sup> On the preferences of Karaim translators in the Song of Moses concerning Hebrew genitive constructions, see Olach (forthcoming).

<sup>4</sup> Only a derived form can be found in KRPS (246) marked as an element of the Trakai Karaim and the Halich Karaim lexicon: *yoxtan bar etiwci* ‘one who creates from nothing’.

<sup>5</sup> The shortened form of the copula *–dur* can be found in the Halich Karaim verse, i.e. *ol:du* [he:COP3SG] ‘he is’ (Musaev 1964, 129–130).

### *Theologically interpretive additions*

In order to demonstrate theologically interpretive additions representing religious concepts of Karaim, the basic dogmas of Karaitism, i.e. the Ten Principles of Faith of the Karaites acknowledged also by Karaim will be used.

Christianity, as well as Islam, had already a fixed dogma and creed by the twelfth century, when the Karaite theologian Yehuda Hadassi composed the Ten Principles of the Karaite faith. Those dogmas and creed composed the basis for the Karaite Ten Principles. As it can be seen, all the Karaite Principles begin like the Credo: I believe in full faith that.... Later, other Karaite scholars, e.g. Eliya Bashyachi, issued their own versions of the principles (Tuori forthcoming). The Principles have always been studied by the Karaim and they were thought to the children of the Karaim communities.<sup>6</sup>

Shorter or longer versions of the Principles have been published several times, e.g. by Jacob b. Benjamin Duvan (1890), Ananiasz Zajączkowski (1964), Mariola Abkowicz (1987). In this study, the Principles will be quoted as Harviainen gives them (2003, 839–840).<sup>7</sup>

Besides the Ten Principles, when they are relevant, the Ten Commandments will be referred as well. The Ten Commandments are called *On Siożlary Tienriniń* ('The Ten Words of God') in Trakai Karaim and were published in 1935 by Szimon Firkowicz. Mykolas Firkovičius, the late leader of the Trakai Karaim community published the Ten Commandments again with slight modifications in 1993.

### *Theologically interpretive additions – The concept of the only God*

According to the Third Principle, there is no other God but the only true God. The Principle reads as follows: „I believe in full faith that the Creator has no similarity, He is absolutely one in every respect and there is no oneness as His oneness, He is not a body and the qualities of a body do not apply to him” (Harviainen 2003, 839).

The concept of the only God together with the disallowance of worshipping other gods or idols are expressed also in the Karaim Ten Commandments. The beginning of the Second Commandment reads as follows: „*Bołmasyn saja öźgia tienrilar, kybłalarym alnyna. Kyłmahyn öziuja jonma abach da hiecz tiursiuń nieki kioklardia johartyn da nieki jerdia aszahartyn, da nieki suwłarda aszahartyn jergia. Basz urmahyn alarha da kulluch ełmiagiń alarha, ki mień Adonaj Tienrij sienin [...]*.” “There shall be no gods of your own, in front of my divine face. Do not make carved idol for yourself and no image at all neither in the heavens above nor on the earth below, nor in the waters under the earth. Do not worship them and do not serve them, because I am the LORD, your God [...].” (Firkovičius 1993, 5).

In v. 16 in the Song of Moses, we see how the people of Israel broke the Third Principle and the Second Commandment as well: ‘They stirred him to jealousy with strange gods; with abominations they provoked him to anger’. By the addition of *qulluq etkenleri bila* ‘with his serving of’ in the Halich Karaim translation, the action of serving is emphasized. Moreover, the idea of other God(s) is replaced by the expression ‘idol’: *da kinilikke keltirdiler anı qulluq etkenleri bila yat abaqlarğa* [and jealousy:DAT bring: DL PST 3 PL he:ACC serve:GAN:POSS 3 PL with strange idol:PL:DAT] ‘and they made him jealous with serving strange idols’. In comparison, the idea of rejection other God(s) does not occur

---

<sup>6</sup> A number of Karaim scholars wrote commentaries and/or poems on the Principles; see Nemoj 1989, Tuori 2014, Tuori (forthcoming). Such poems were recited before or after the official worship in the kenesa (Karaim house of prayer) or at home during meals (Tuori 2014, 84).

<sup>7</sup> Since Duvan published his work in Hebrew and Russian, Harviainen, in his article, lists the Principles given by Duvan in English.

in the other Karaim translations, so we find *yat tañrılar bilän* / *yat tangrılar bilän* / *yat Teñrılar bila* [strange god:PL with] ‘with foreign Gods’.

(3)

Deut. 32: 16

|     |   |                            |                                     |   |  |  |  |  |                            |
|-----|---|----------------------------|-------------------------------------|---|--|--|--|--|----------------------------|
| BH  | <i>yaqnı<sup>2</sup>úhú</i><br>they made him jealous  |                            | <i>bəzārim</i><br>with strange (PL) |   | <i>bəǰō<sup>c</sup>ēbōt</i><br>with abominations |  | <i>yaq<sup>c</sup>ısúhú</i><br>they provoked him |  |                            |
|     | ‘They stirred him to jealousy with strange gods; with abominations they provoked him to anger.’ |                            |                                     |   |  |  |  |  |                            |
| CrM | <i>küllättilər</i><br>they made<br>jealous  | <i>anı</i><br>him<br>(ACC) | <i>yat</i><br>strange               | <i>tañrılar</i><br>gods                           | <i>bilän</i><br>with                             | <i>iränçiliklär</i><br>meanesses             | <i>bilän</i><br>with                             | <i>açuwlandirdılar</i><br>they made<br>angry | <i>anı</i><br>him<br>(ACC) |
| CrG | <i>künlättilər</i><br>they made<br>jealous  | <i>anı</i><br>him<br>(ACC) | <i>yat</i><br>strange               | <i>tañrılar</i><br>gods                           | <i>bilän</i><br>with                             | <i>ıqraxlıqlar</i><br>abominations           | <i>bilän</i><br>with                             | <i>açuwlandirdılar</i><br>they made<br>angry | <i>anı</i><br>him<br>(ACC) |
| TF  | <i>K’un’ul’attıl’ar</i><br>they made<br>jealous   | <i>anı</i><br>him<br>(ACC) | <i>yat</i><br>strange               | <i>T’eñril’ar</i><br>gods                         | <i>bıla,</i><br>with                             | <i>ir’ançilikl’ar</i><br>meanesses           | <i>bıla</i><br>with                              | <i>açırhandirdılar</i><br>they made<br>angry | <i>Anı</i><br>him<br>(ACC) |
| HA  | <i>kinilediler</i><br>they made<br>jealous  | <i>anar</i><br>to him      | <i>da</i><br>and                    | <i>kinilikke keltirdiler</i><br>they made jealous |  | <i>anı</i><br>him<br>(ACC)                   | <i>qulluq etkenleri</i><br>their serving         | <i>bıla</i><br>with                          |                            |
|     | <i>yat</i><br>strange   | <i>abaqlarğa</i><br>idols  | <i>yerenci</i><br>abominable        | <i>isler</i><br>things                            | <i>bıla</i><br>with                              | <i>açırğandırtılar</i><br>they made<br>angry | <i>anı</i><br>him (ACC)                          |  |                            |

Similarly, the expression *qulluq etkenleri bila* [serve: GAN:POSS3PL with] ‘with their serving’ is added to the Halich Karaim version in v. 21 in the context ‘they made me jealous with their serving to non-God’; see example (4) below. In the other Karaim translations we find only ‘they made me jealous with non-God’. Since there is no God except the one true God for Karaim, the translator of the Halich Karaim translation felt it necessary to explain that the people made jealous God not with other (non-)Gods but with SERVING other (non-)Gods.

(4)

Deut. 32: 21

|     |   |   |                             |   |                      |  |  |   |  |                      |
|-----|---|---|-----------------------------|---|----------------------|--|--|---|--|----------------------|
| BH  | <i>hēm</i><br>they  | <i>qın<sup>2</sup>úni</i><br>they made me jealous |                             | <i>bəlo<sup>2</sup>-’el</i><br>with-not-God |                      | <i>kı<sup>c</sup>āsúni</i><br>they provoked me to<br>anger |  | <i>bəha<sup>2</sup>blēhem</i><br>with their idols |  |                      |
|     | ‘They have made me jealous with what is no god; they have provoked me to anger with their idols.’ |   |                             |   |                      |  |  |   |  |                      |
| CrM | <i>alar</i><br>they   | <i>künlättilər</i><br>they made<br>jealous        | <i>meni</i><br>me<br>(ACC)  | <i>tañrı</i><br>god                         | <i>bilän</i><br>with | <i>dügil</i><br>not  | <i>açuwlandirdılar</i><br>they made<br>angry | <i>meni</i><br>me<br>(ACC)                        | <i>hevlikläri</i><br>their<br>quarrels     | <i>bilän</i><br>with |
| CrG | <i>alar</i><br>they   | <i>künlättilər</i><br>they made<br>jealous        | <i>meni</i><br>me<br>(ACC)  | <i>tañrı</i><br>god                         | <i>bilän</i><br>with | <i>dügül</i><br>not  | <i>açuwlandirdılar</i><br>they made<br>angry | <i>meni</i><br>me<br>(ACC)                        | <i>heçlikläri</i><br>their<br>paltriness   | <i>bilän</i><br>with |
| TF  | <i>alar</i><br>they   | <i>k’un’ul’attıl’ar</i><br>they made<br>jealous   | <i>M’eni</i><br>me<br>(ACC) | <i>t’uv’ul’</i><br>not                      | <i>T’eñri</i><br>god | <i>bıla,</i><br>with                                       | <i>açırhandirdılar</i><br>they made<br>angry | <i>M’eni</i><br>me<br>(ACC)                       | <i>h’eçlikl’ari</i><br>their<br>paltriness | <i>bıla</i><br>with  |
| HA  | <i>alar</i><br>they   | <i>kinilettiler</i><br>they made<br>jealous       | <i>meni</i><br>me<br>(ACC)  | <i>qulluq etkenleri</i><br>their serving    |                      | <i>bıla</i><br>not   | <i>tivil</i><br>not                          | <i>tenrige</i><br>god                             |  |                      |
|     | <i>açırğandırtılar</i><br>they made<br>angry  | <i>meni</i><br>me<br>(ACC)                        | <i>hec</i>                  | <i>abaqları</i><br>their<br>paltriness      | <i>bıla</i><br>with  |  |  |   |  |                      |

### Theologically interpretive additions - Resolving anthropomorphism

The Third Principle of Faith is the basis for the following Karaim religious concept as well. Since the Principle says that “He (i.e. God) is not a body and the qualities of a body do not apply to him” (Harviainen 2003, 839), Karaim avoid the anthropomorphic description of God. Therefore, expression such as ‘the hand of God’, ‘the breath of God’ is not used in Karaim Bible translations (Zajączkowski 1961, 28–29). Since God is not antropomorph for Karaim, it is not possible that God has sons like human beings. Therefore, in v. 5, the Halich Karaim translator added a verb *indel:me:di:ler* [be called:NEG:DI.PST3PL] ‘they were not called’; see example (5) below. It demonstrates, that it was important for the translator to emphasize that people cannot be the sons of God, but they can be called as the sons of God.

Besides, a textually interpretive addition can also be observed in the Halich Karaim text in the same verse: *uwul:lar:i qayam tenri:nin* [son:PL:POSS3SG eternal god:GEN] ‘sons of the Eternal God’. This addition serves as a clarification who is he in the expression *uwul:lar:i anin* [son:PL:POSS3SG he:GEN] ‘his sons’.

(5)

Deut. 32: 5

|     |   |                                    |                                   |                                   |   |                                    |                            |                                    |                              |                                 |
|-----|---|------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|---|------------------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------------|------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| BH  | <i>šihēt</i><br>he<br>caused<br>trouble<br>‘They have dealt corruptly with him; they are no longer his children because they are blemished; they are a crooked and twisted generation.’ | <i>lō</i><br>to him                | <i>lōʹ</i><br>not                 | <i>bānāyw</i><br>his sons         | <i>mūmām</i><br>their blemish                 | <i>dōr</i><br>generation           | <i>ʹiqqēš</i><br>perverted | <i>ūpəʹaltōl</i>                   |                              |                                 |
| CrM | <i>čaypadī</i><br>he<br>destroyed   | <i>kendini</i><br>himself<br>(ACC) | <i>Israel</i><br>Israel           | <i>tangrī</i><br>god              | <i>dügül,</i><br>not                          | <i>da</i><br>and                   | <i>alar</i><br>they        | <i>dügüldir</i><br>not<br>(COP3SG) | <i>oğlanları</i><br>his sons |                                 |
|     | <i>da</i><br>and  | <i>budir</i><br>this<br>(COP3SG)   | <i>ol</i><br>the                  | <i>ayipları</i><br>their<br>shame | <i>ters</i><br>wrong                          | <i>dävir</i><br>generation         | <i>da</i><br>and           | <i>qingir</i><br>crooked           |                              |                                 |
| CrG | <i>čaypadī</i><br>he<br>destroyed   | <i>kendini</i><br>himself<br>(ACC) | <i>Yisra'el</i><br>Israel         | <i>tangrī</i><br>god              | <i>dügül,</i><br>not                          | <i>da</i><br>and                   | <i>alar</i><br>they        | <i>dügüldir</i><br>not<br>(COP3SG) | <i>oğlanları</i><br>his sons |                                 |
|     | <i>da</i><br>and  | <i>budir</i><br>this<br>(COP3SG)   | <i>ol</i><br>the                  | <i>ayipları</i><br>their<br>shame | <i>ters</i><br>wrong                          | <i>däwür</i><br>generation         | <i>da</i><br>and           | <i>qingir</i><br>crooked           |                              |                                 |
| TF  | <i>čeypadī</i><br>he<br>destroyed   | <i>t'uv'ul'</i><br>not             | <i>öz'uh,</i><br>himself<br>(ACC) | <i>ančex</i><br>but               | <i>ulanlarına</i><br>to his sons              | <i>ayıpl'arı</i><br>their<br>shame | <i>alarnin;</i><br>their   |                                    |                              |                                 |
|     | <i>dor</i><br>generation  | <i>t'ers</i><br>wrong              | <i>da</i><br>and                  | <i>tornaxši</i><br>crooked        |   |                                    |                            |                                    |                              |                                 |
| HA  | <i>caypadī</i><br>he<br>destroyed   | <i>ezi</i><br>himself              | <i>ezin</i><br>himself<br>(ACC)   | <i>yisra'el</i><br>Israel         | <i>indelmediler</i><br>they are not<br>called | <i>uwulları</i><br>his sons        | <i>anin</i><br>his         | <i>uwulları</i><br>his sons        | <i>qayam</i><br>eternal      | <i>tenrinin</i><br>God<br>(GEN) |
|     | <i>da</i><br>and  | <i>bu</i><br>this                  | <i>boldu</i><br>became            | <i>ayıpları</i><br>their<br>shame | <i>alarnin</i><br>their                       | <i>dor</i><br>generation           | <i>ters</i><br>wrong       | <i>da</i><br>and                   | <i>tornaqsı</i><br>crooked   |                                 |

In order to evade the possibility of misinterpretation, Karaim translators inserted some non-anthropomorphic expressions into the tenth verse of the Song of Moses; see example (6) below. The Hebrew verse reads as follows: ‘He found him in a desert land, and in the howling waste of the wilderness; he encircled him, he cared for him, he kept him as the apple of his eye’. In the Gözleve Bible, we can see two additions: *čewrälä:di anı bulut:u bilän* [surround:DI.PST3SG he:ACC cloud:POSS3SG with] ‘he (i.e. God) surrounded him with his cloud’ and *aqıllandır:dı anı tora:sı bilän* [make wise:DI.PST3SG he:ACC law:POSS3SG with] ‘he



made him wise with his law'. The expressions *qurša:di anī bulut:u bīla* [surround:DI.PST3SG he:ACC cloud:POSS3SG with] 'he surrounded him with his cloud' and *abra:di anī hašgaxa:sī bīla* [protect:DI.PST3SG he:ACC superior supervision:POSS3SG with] 'he protected him with his superior supervision' occur in the Trakai Karaim translation. In the Halich Karaim version, we find all the three expressions: *qurša:di anī bulut:u bīla* [surround:DI.PST3SG he:ACC cloud:POSS3SG with] 'he surrounded him with his cloud', *aqill(at):tī anī tora:sī bīla* [make wise:DI.PST3SG he:ACC law:POSS3SG with] 'he made him wise with his law' and *abra:di anī hašgaxa:sī bīla* [protect:DI.PST3SG he:ACC superior supervision:POSS3SG with] 'he protected him with his superior supervision'. Thus, the inserted expressions 'cloud', 'law' and 'superior supervision' presents a God operating with higher power.

Furthermore, the Halich Karaim translation contains a clause expressing comparison (*abra:ganlay kisi bebey:i:n kez:i:nin* [protect:GANLAY person pupil:POSS3SG:ACC eye:POSS3SG:GEN] 'like a person protects the apple of his eye'. This clause can be classified as a textually interpretive addition.

(6)  
Deut. 32: 10

|     |  |                                      |  |                                  |  |  |                                      |                                 |                                 |  |                     |
|-----|--|--------------------------------------|--|----------------------------------|--|--|--------------------------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|--|---------------------|
| BH  | <i>yəsǫbǫbǫnhū</i><br>he encompassed him | <i>yǫbǫnǫnhū</i><br>he cared for him | <i>yiššǫrǫnhū</i><br>he kept him         | <i>kǫʔišǫn</i><br>like pupil     | <i>ʕǫnǫ</i><br>of his eye                                | 'He encircled him, he cared for him, he kept him as the apple of his eye.' |                                      |                                 |                                 |  |                     |
| CrM | <i>čewrālādi</i><br>he surrounded        | <i>anī</i><br>him (ACC)              | <i>aqillandirdi</i><br>wise              | <i>anī</i><br>him (ACC)          | <i>saqladi</i><br>protected                              | <i>anī</i><br>him (ACC)  | <i>bābāgi</i><br>pupil of            | <i>kibik</i><br>like            | <i>kōziniŋ</i><br>his eye (GEN) |  |                     |
| CrG | <i>čewrālādi</i><br>he surrounded        | <i>anī</i><br>him (ACC)              | <i>bulutu</i><br>his cloud               | <i>bīlān</i><br>with             | <i>aqillandirdi</i><br>wise                              | <i>anī</i><br>him (ACC)  | <i>torasī</i><br>his law             | <i>bīlān</i><br>with            |                                 |  |                     |
|     | <i>saqladi</i><br>he protected           | <i>anī</i><br>him (ACC)              |  | <i>gōzūning</i><br>his eye (GEN) |  | <i>bābāgini</i><br>his pupil (ACC)   | <i>gibi</i><br>like                  |                                 |                                 |  |                     |
| TF  | <i>quršadi</i><br>he surrounded          | <i>anī</i><br>him (ACC)              | <i>bulutu</i><br>cloud                   | <i>bīla</i><br>with              | <i>aqillatti</i><br>made wise                            | <i>anī</i><br>him (ACC)  | <i>da</i><br>and                     | <i>abradi</i><br>protected      | <i>anī</i><br>him (ACC)         | <i>hašgaxasī</i><br>superior supervision | <i>bīla</i><br>with |
|     | <i>b'eb'ayin</i><br>his pupil of (ACC)   | <i>kibik</i><br>like                 | <i>k'oz'un'un</i><br>his eye (GEN)       |                                  |  |  |                                      |                                 |                                 |  |                     |
| HA  | <i>qursadi</i><br>he surrounded          | <i>anī</i><br>him (ACC)              | <i>bulutu</i><br>his cloud               | <i>bīla</i><br>with              | <i>aqill(at)tī</i><br>wise                               | <i>anī</i><br>him (ACC)  | <i>torasī</i><br>his law             | <i>bīla</i><br>with             |                                 |  |                     |
|     | <i>abradi</i><br>protected               | <i>anī</i><br>him (ACC)              | <i>hašgaxasī</i><br>superior supervision | <i>bīla</i><br>with              | <i>abrağanlay</i> <sup>8</sup><br>like one who protected | <i>kisi</i><br>person  | <i>bebeyin</i><br>his pupil of (ACC) | <i>kezinin</i><br>his eye (GEN) |                                 |  |                     |

### Theologically interpretive additions – the concept of Exile

The v. 29 of the Song of Moses reads as follows: 'If they were wise, they would understand this; they would discern their latter end.' However, in the Halich Karaim translation – in this verse – a clause is added to the end of that: *yišra'el:nin nendiy asayislik bol:ur alar:ga cik:sa:lar ol icinci galut:tan* [Israel:GEN what pleasure be:R.NPST3SG they:DAT go out:HYP3PL the third exile:ABL] '(they would turn their attention to the end) of Israel, what a joy it will be for them when they get out of the third exile!'; see example (7) below. Thus, the translator

<sup>8</sup> The converb –*GANLAY* is not listed among Karaim suffixes published by Zajaczkowski (1932a), but it can be attested in other Kipchak languages, e.g. Kazakh (Kirchner 1998, 329), Noghay (Csató & Karakoç 1998, 340).

expresses his hope and belief in the escape from the Exile. Actually, this is what the Tenth Principle of Faith orders for all Karaite believers.

According to this Principle, „God has not disparaged us who live in the Diaspora, although at this moment we are under His chastisements. Every son of Israel who believes in God is always obliged to wish and wait for His salvation, which is to take place by the hands of His Messiah from the House of David, and for the restoration of His Temple” (Harviainen 2003, 840).

(7)

Deut. 32: 29

|     |   |                                    |  |   |                                |   |   |                        |                                  |
|-----|---|------------------------------------|--|---|--------------------------------|---|---|------------------------|----------------------------------|
| BH  | <i>lū</i><br>would that   | <i>ḥākḡmū</i><br>they were<br>wise | <i>yaškīlū</i><br>they<br>understand     | <i>zōʔt</i><br>this                               | <i>yābīnū</i><br>they consider | <i>ləʔaḥārītām</i><br>to their end                      |   |                        |                                  |
|     | ‘If they were wise, they would understand this; they would discern their latter end!’ |                                    |  |   |                                |   |   |                        |                                  |
| CrM | <i>vali</i><br>if   | <i>uslī</i><br>wise                | <i>bolḡay edilār,</i><br>they would be   | <i>aḡlaḡay edilār</i><br>they would<br>understand | <i>muni,</i><br>this<br>(ACC)  | <i>aḡlaḡay edilār</i><br>they would<br>understand       | <i>axīrlarīn</i><br>their end<br>(ACC)  |                        |                                  |
| CrG | <i>egār</i><br>if   | <i>uslu</i><br>wise                | <i>bolsalar edilār,</i><br>they would be | <i>aḡlar edilār</i><br>they would<br>understand   | <i>muni,</i><br>this<br>(ACC)  | <i>düşünir edilār</i><br>they would think               | <i>axīrlarīni</i><br>their end<br>(ACC) |                        |                                  |
| TF  | <i>Ėḡ’er</i><br>if  | <i>uslu</i><br>wise                | <i>bolsa edil’ar</i><br>they would be    | <i>anlaha edil’ar</i><br>they would<br>understand | <i>bunu,</i><br>this<br>(ACC)  | <i>ēsl’arīn koyha edil’ar</i><br>they would<br>consider | <i>sonhularīna</i><br>to their end      |                        |                                  |
| HA  | <i>yezeli</i><br>if   | <i>uslu</i><br>wise                | <i>bolsiydīlar</i><br>they would be      | <i>anlaḡyīdīlar</i><br>they would<br>understand   | <i>bunu</i><br>this<br>(ACC)   | <i>eslerin qoyḡyīdīlar</i><br>they would<br>consider    | <i>songularīna</i><br>to their end      |                        |                                  |
|     | <i>visra’elnin</i><br>Israel (GEN)  | <i>nendiy</i><br>what              | <i>asayisliḡ</i><br>pleasure             | <i>bolur</i><br>it will<br>be                     | <i>alarḡa</i><br>to them       | <i>cīqsalar</i><br>if they<br>go out                    | <i>ol</i><br>the                        | <i>icinci</i><br>third | <i>galuttan</i><br>from<br>exile |

## Conclusions

In this study, only a few of the additions have been demonstrated. Taking into account the proportion of the additions, however, there are certain differences. Additions occur in all the books of the Karaim Bible translations. As for the Song of Moses, different proportions in the different Karaim translations can be observed. The highest proportion of additions – in the discussed versions – can be found in the Halich Karaim translation: altogether twenty-three additions of the textually interpretive type and ten insertions of the theologically interpretive type occur. In the Trakai Karaim version, the proportion is fifteen textually interpretive additions and four theologically interpretive additions. In the Gözleve Bible, twenty-four textually interpretive additions can be attested, but only two additions of the theologically interpretive type. Textually interpretive additions appear twelve times, whereas theologically interpretive additions are not characteristics of the other Crimean Karaim translation kept in Manchester.

To sum up, the Halich Karaim translator of the Abrahamowicz Bible applied far more additions than the translators of the other Karaim Bible translations. It is a very interesting feature of the Abrahamowicz Bible, since this translation, as it was illustrated it in Olach 2013, is the closest both to the semantic and the morpho-syntactic patterns of the Hebrew original.

As the analysis of the additions has demonstrated it, these additions provide information about the basic religious concepts of the Karaim such as the concept of the only God who has no body, thus anthropomorph visualization of God is not acceptable. A comprehensive study on the additions in Karaim Bible translations, thus, will shed light on

other religious notions and also on the influence of Rabbinic Judaism, Christianity and Islam on these basic concepts.

## Abbreviations

### Sources

|      |  |
|------|--|
| CrG  | Crimean Karaim Bible translation published in Gözleve (1841)   |
| CrM  | Crimean Karaim Bible translation kept in Manchester  |
| HA   | Halich Karaim Bible translation in the possession of the Abrahamowicz family   |
| KRPS | Baskakov, N. A. – Zajączkowski, A. – Szapszal, S. M. (1974): <i>Karaimsko-russko-pol'skij slovar'</i> . Moskva, Russkij Jazyk.                         |
| RBE  | <i>Redhouse Büyük Elsözlüğü. İngilizce-Türkçe, Türkçe-İngilizce / The Larger Redhouse Portable Dictionary. English-Turkish, Turkish-English</i> (1994) |
| TF   | Trakai Karaim Bible translation published by Mykolas Firkovičius (1993)  |

### Glosses in the examples

|        |                           |
|--------|---------------------------|
| 3      | Third person              |
| ABL    | Ablative                  |
| ACC    | Accusative                |
| COP    | Copula                    |
| DAT    | Dative                    |
| DI.PST | Past in <i>-DI</i>        |
| GANLAY | Converb in <i>-GAnlAy</i> |
| GEN    | Genitive                  |
| HYP    | Hypothetical              |
| NEG    | Negation                  |
| PL     | Plural                    |
| POSS   | Possessive                |
| R.NPST | Non-past in <i>-(V)r</i>  |
| SG     | Singular                  |

## References

- Abkowicz, M. (1987): Główne zasady doktrynalne religii karaimskiej. Karaimi (Materialy z sesji naukowej, pod redakcją Aleksandra Dubińskiego & Eugeniusza Śliwki, III Pieniężnieńskie spotkania z religiami, Materiały i Studia Księży Werbistów Nr. 32), Pieniężno. 9–15.
- Baskakov, N. A. – Zajączkowski, A. – Szapszal, S. M. (1974): *Karaimsko-russko-pol'skij slovar'*. Moskva: Russkij Jazyk.
- Bezmez, S. et al. (eds.) (1994): *Redhouse Büyük Elsözlüğü. İngilizce-Türkçe, Türkçe-İngilizce / The Larger Redhouse Portable Dictionary. English-Turkish, Turkish-English*. İstanbul, Redhouse Yayınevi.
- Csató, É. Á. – Karakoç, B. (1998): Noghay. In: Johanson, L. – Csató, É. Á. (eds.) *The Turkic languages*. London–New York. 333–343.
- Duvan, B. b. (1890): *Katihizis, osnovy karaimskago zakona*. St. Petersburg, Tipografiâ Èttungera.
- Firkovičius, M. (1993): *Karaj koltchalary*. Vilnius, Lietuvos rašytojų sąjungos leidykla.

- Firkovičius, M. (1998–1999): *Karaj diñliliarniñ jalbarmach jergialiari* Vol. 1–2. Vilnius, Baltos Lankos.
- Firkowicz, Sz. (1935): *Koltchalar. Krótkie modlitwy karaimskie*. Vilnius, Wydanie Autora.
- Harviainen, T. (2003): The Karaites in contemporary Lithuania and the former USSR. In: Polliack, M. (ed.) *Karaite Judaism. A guide to its history and literary sources*. (Handbook of Oriental Studies 1: 73.) Leiden–Boston. 827–854.
- Jankowski, H. (1997) A Bible translation into the Northern Crimean dialect of Karaim. *Studia Orientalia* Vol. 28, 1–84.
- Jankowski, H. (2009): Translations of the Bible into Karaim. *Religion Compass* 2009, No. 3/4, 502–523.
- Kirchner, M. (1998): Kazakh and Karakalpak. In: Johanson, L. – Csató, É. Á. (eds.) 1998. *The Turkic languages*. London–New York. 318–332.
- Musaev, K. M. (1964): *Grammatika karaimskiego jazyka. Fonetika i morfologija*. Moskva, Nauka.
- Nemoy, L. (1978): Karaites. In: Donzel, E. – Lewis, B. – Pellat, Ch. (eds.) *The Encyclopaedia of Islam* Vol. 4. New Edition. Leiden–Boston. 603–608.
- Nemoy, L. (1989): Isaac ben Solomon on the Karaite Creed. *The Jewish Quarterly Review* Vol. 80, No. 1/2, 49–85.
- Olach, Zs. (2013): *A Halich Karaim translation of Hebrew biblical texts*. (Turcologica 98.) Wiesbaden, Harrassowitz.
- Olach, Zs. (forthcoming) *The Jewish culture and its literature among Karaim. The Song of Moses*.
- Polliack, M. (1997): *The Karaite tradition of Arabic Bible translation: a linguistic and exegetical study of Karaite translation of the Pentateuch from the tenth and eleventh centuries CE*. Leiden–New York–Köln, Brill.
- Shapira, D. (2003): The Turkic languages and literatures of the East European Karaites. In: Polliack, M. (ed.) *Karaite Judaism. A guide to its history and literary sources*. (Handbook of Oriental Studies 1: 73.) Leiden–Boston. 657–707.
- Tuori, R. (2014): Defining Karaite faith in early nineteenth-century Europe: A poem on the Five Principles of Faith. *Frankfurter Judaistische Beiträge* Vol. 39, 83–101.
- Tuori, R. (in print) The Ten Principles of Karaite Faith in a Seventeenth-Century Hebrew Poem from Troki. *Acta Orientalia Vilnensia*.
- Zajączkowski, A. (1932a): *Sufiksy imienne I czasownikowe w języku zachodniokaraimskim (przyczynek do morfologii języków tureckich). Les suffixes nominaux et verbaux dans la langue des Karaims occidentaux (contribution à la morphologie des langues turques)*. (Prace Komisji Orientalistycznej Polskiej Akademji Umiejętności 15) Kraków, Nakładem Polskiej Akademji Umiejętności.
- Zajączkowski, A. (1932b): Przekłady Trenów Jeremjasza w narzeczu trocko-karaimskim. *Rocznik Orientalistyczny* Vol. 8, 181–192.
- Zajączkowski, A. (1934): Przekłady Trenów Jeremjasza w narzeczu trocko-karaimskim (tekst i słowniczek). *Rocznik Orientalistyczny* Vol. 10, 158–177.
- Zajączkowski, A. (1961): *Karaims in Poland. History. Language. Folklore. Science*. Warszawa, Państwowe Wydawnictwo Naukowe.
- Zajączkowski, A. (1964): Die karaimische Literatur. In: Bazin, L. – Bombacı, A. – Deny, J. – Gökbilgin, T. – İz, F. – Scheel, H. (eds.) *Philologiae turcicae fundamenta* Vol. 2. Wiesbaden. 793–801.
- Zajączkowski, W. (1980): Karaimische Übersetzungen des Alten Testaments. *Folia Orientalia* Vol. 21, 161–162.