# EFFECT OF HEADSPACE CO<sub>2</sub> CONCENTRATION ON SHELF-LIFE OF COOKED MEAT PRODUCTS

M. SZALAI $^{a*}$ , J. SZIGETI $^b$ , L. FARKAS $^b$ , L. VARGA $^b$ , A. RÉTI $^c$  and E. ZUKÁL $^d$ 

<sup>a</sup> Erma-Pack Inc., H-1094 Budapest, Angyal u. 15/a II. 6. Hungary
 <sup>b</sup> Institute of Food Science, Faculty of Agricultural and Food Sciences,
 University of West Hungary, H-9200 Mosonmagyaróvár, Lucsony u. 15–17. Hungary
 <sup>c</sup> Kaiser Food Inc., H-9151 Abda, Bécsi út 1. Hungary
 <sup>d</sup> Hungarian Meat Research Institute, H-1097 Budapest, Gubacsi út 6/b. Hungary

(Received: 14 March 2003; accepted: 4 February 2004)

The shelf-lives of major commercial cooked meat products (i.e., Bologna sausage, Italian-type cooked sausage, and cooked ham) packaged under vacuum or modified atmospheres were tested in this study. Samples were taken from commercial meat processing lines, sliced to 1.2 mm thickness and placed overlapped into polypropylene trays sealed with plastic films. The headspace of modified atmosphere packaged formulations consisted of 30% CO<sub>2</sub> and 70% N<sub>2</sub> or 60% CO<sub>2</sub> and 40% N<sub>2</sub>. The samples thus produced were stored under refrigerated conditions. The values of microbiological, chemical, physical or sensory properties were plotted against storage time, and Gompertz curves were fitted to all time series that changed from an initial to a final value during any period of storage. The influence of headspace CO<sub>2</sub> concentration on the properties of sliced cooked meat products varied considerably and, therefore, it was not possible to specify general rules. However, the presence of CO<sub>2</sub> in the packaging atmosphere slowed down the rate of microbial growth, thereby delaying the spoilage of meat products. A CO<sub>2</sub> level of 60% had beneficial effects on both the microbiological and sensory properties of sliced sausages and cooked ham. It was concluded that cooked meat products packaged under modified atmospheres had a shelf-life of 20 days.

**Keywords:** cooked meat product, shelf-life, carbon dioxide, modified atmosphere packaging, vacuum packaging

Low gas-permeable packaging films do not only protect packaged foods from external contamination but they also delay spoilage when suitable gas mixtures are used (LAKNER, 1994; 1997). In the case of cooked meat products, the exclusion of  $O_2$  is one of the main objectives. Low partial oxygen pressure inhibits the growth of aerobic microbes, which cause a much faster spoilage than do anaerobic micro-organisms (OORAIKUL, 1991). The oxygen content in the packages may be reduced either by vacuum packaging using oxygen scavengers or by flushing the atmosphere of the packages with various gases. The latter system is often referred to as modified atmosphere packaging (MAP). Usually, a proper mixture of  $N_2$  and  $CO_2$  is used for generating the modified atmosphere. Other tested gases such as CO or NO were found to have no beneficial effect on the shelf-life of cooked meat products (CHURCH, 1993).

Phone: +36 1 476 8075; fax: +36 1 476 8076; e-mail: szalaim@axelero.hu

<sup>\*</sup> To whom correspondence should be addressed.

The presence of CO<sub>2</sub> in the headspace of packages increases the lag phase of micro-organisms and decreases their maximal growth rate (FARBER, 1991). A mixture of CO<sub>2</sub> and N<sub>2</sub> containing 20 to 30% CO<sub>2</sub> results in residual oxygen levels of below 1%, which also inhibit the growth of yeasts. However, CO<sub>2</sub> contents of over 30% may cause dripping, discolouration, and a sour odour (AHVENAINEN, 1990). Higher CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations (over 50%) suppress the growth of *Listeria monocytogenes*, *Staphylococcus aureus*, *Salmonella* spp., *Escherichia coli* and *Yersinia enterocolitica* (LEFEVRE, 1990).

In this work, the shelf-life of different cooked meat products packaged under modified atmospheres containing various CO<sub>2</sub> levels was examined in an attempt to determine whether the adverse changes known from the literature can also be observed in Hungarian products.

# 1. Materials and methods

# 1.1. Products tested

Three types of major commercial cooked meat products were tested in this study. The chemical composition of the products selected is shown in Table 1. Samples were taken from normal meat processing lines.

			•		
Product	Moisture	Protein	Fat	NaCl	$P_2O_5$
			content (%)		
Bologna sausage	62.0	10.6	19.5	2.2	0.20
Italian-type cooked sausage	52.7	13.0	28.8	2.3	0.25
Cooked ham	74.6	13.4	5.9	2.9	0.42

Table 1. Chemical composition of the products tested

- 1.1.1. Bologna sausage. Pork meat, beef meat and pork fat were homogenized in a cutter with water, nitrite curing salt and spices being added to the meat batter, which was stuffed into artificial casings (9 cm in diameter) and cooked at an internal temperature of 71 °C. The sausages were then kept at this temperature for 10 min, and cooled down.
- 1.1.2. Italian-type cooked sausage. Pork meat, beef meat and pork fat chopped into approximately 4×4×4 mm cubes were mixed with meat batter, nitrite curing salt and spices. This batter was then stuffed into 7.5-cm diameter artificial casings, cooked at 75 °C for 120 min, and cooled down.
- 1.1.3. Cooked ham. Pork meat pieces were tumbled in a brine containing nitrite curing salt, sodium polyphosphate and sodium ascorbate, aged, and then stuffed into deep-drawn plastic film packages (9 cm in diameter), which were cooked up to a core temperature of 70 °C, and cooled down.

# 1.2. Packaging and storage

The outer layer of the samples was frozen, and then the products were sliced to 1.2 mm thickness and placed overlapped into polypropylene trays sealed with plastic films. Darfresh WEB films were used for vacuum packaging and Multibarrier 4 films for MAP. The headspace of modified atmosphere packaged cooked meat products consisted of either 30% CO<sub>2</sub> and 70% N<sub>2</sub> or 60% CO<sub>2</sub> and 40% N<sub>2</sub>. The samples thus produced were weighed, placed in cardboard boxes and stored protected from light exposure at 2 to 4 °C.

# 1.3. Sampling, analyses, and evaluation of results

Samples were taken after 1, 5, 11, 15, 20, 25 and 29 days of storage and microbiological, chemical, physical and sensory analyses were carried out on two samples from each day. The total experimental program was repeated twice.

- 1.3.1. Enumeration of micro-organisms. The viable counts or presence/absence of the following micro-organisms were determined according to Hungarian and German official methods: total plate count (HUNGARIAN STANDARD, 1986), lactobacilli (DEUTSCHES INSTITUT FÜR NORMUNG, 1991), Salmonella spp. (HUNGARIAN STANDARD, 1999), Staphylococcus aureus (HUNGARIAN STANDARD, 1985), enterococci (HUNGARIAN STANDARD, 1976), Escherichia coli (HUNGARIAN STANDARD, 1979) and mesophilic sulphite-reducing clostridia (HUNGARIAN STANDARD, 1978).
- 1.3.2. Determination of nitrite content and pH value. The nitrite level of products was determined according to the official method of analysis used in Hungary (HUNGARIAN STANDARD, 1981), and their pH was assessed by means of an ISFET 101 pH meter (Delta TRAK Inc., Pleasanton, CA, USA) and a LanceFET spear tip electrode on a homogenate consisting of 5 g of sample in 50 ml of distilled water.
- 1.3.3. Colour measurement. The colour of cooked meat products was measured using a Minolta CR-300 chromameter (with aperture diameter and viewing angle set at 8 mm and 0°, respectively) and described numerically by the CIELAB colour space model. L\* is a degree of lightness ranging from 0 (black) to 100 (white) along a gray scale. Positive a\* values are red and negative a\* values are green. Positive b\* values are yellow and negative b\* values are blue. Chroma  $\{[(a*)^2+(b*)^2]^{1/2}\}$  is a measure of colour saturation and hue (b\*/a\*) is the colour angle (COMISSION INTERNATIONALE DE L'ECLAIRAGE, 1978).
- 1.3.4. Sensory evaluation. Samples from each formulation were randomly assigned for sensory evaluation to a 5-member panel, 2 min after the vacuum or modified atmosphere packages were opened. Properties were assessed using a 5-point rating scale ranging from 0 to 4. A score of 0 from an individual panellist indicated unacceptability for consumption in terms of the organoleptic characteristic tested. The following sensory properties of the cooked meat products were assessed: drip formation, intensity and freshness of odour and flavour, slime formation, stickiness and cohesiveness of slices.

1.3.5. Curve fitting. Gompertz curves were fitted to time series that changed from an initial to a final value during any period of storage (ZWIETERING et al., 1990). The initial value, the initial and final points in time of the fast change, and the final value were determined on the basis of the curve fitted (Fig. 1). Proper polynomials were also fitted to the other time series and the characteristic values were determined based on these polynomials.

# y(0) Xe 10 Xe 20

Fig. 1. Characteristic points of curve fitting. y(0): Value of parameter tested on day 0; y(29): value of parameter tested on day 29; x<sub>s</sub>: start of change; x<sub>e</sub>: end of change

Time, day

### 2. Results and discussion

As shown in Table 2, the total plate count (TPC) of Bologna sausage started to increase after 5 to 6 days of storage on average, independently of the headspace  $\rm CO_2$  concentration. The TPC of Italian-type cooked sausage began increasing only on day 11; however, a  $\rm CO_2$  content of 60% put the start of increase off until day 18. The TPC of cooked ham packed under vacuum kept increasing from the beginning of storage, whereas MAP considerably delayed the start of increase.

Because the enumeration of microbial counts in solid samples is not sufficiently accurate below the level of  $10^2\,\mathrm{CFU}\,\mathrm{g}^{-1}$ , the initial lactobacilli counts presented in Table 3 are not highly reliable. Owing to the low initial counts in Bologna sausage, it was only the packaging atmosphere containing 60%  $\mathrm{CO}_2$  that had a slight delaying effect on the growth of lactobacilli. Headspace  $\mathrm{CO}_2$  levels decreased the growth rate of

lactobacilli in cooked ham and Italian-type cooked sausage. The proportion of lactobacilli in both sausage varieties increased as storage progressed, and in cooked ham the microflora was composed mainly of lactobacilli even at the beginning of the storage period.

Table 2. Changes in total plate counts<sup>a</sup> of products during storage under various packaging atmospheres

Product	CO <sub>2</sub>	Initial count	Start of increase	Final count	End of increase
	(%)	(log)	(day)	(log)	(day)
Bologna sausage	0	2.0	5.6	7.0	16.2
	30	2.0	4.9	6.9	21.2
	60	2.0	6.5	7.0	29.0
			SD=0.19		
Italian-type cooked sausage	0	3.0	11.3	6.0	16.8
	30	3.0	10.4	6.0	24.7
	60	3.0	17.7	6.0	28.4
			SD=0.04		
Cooked ham	0	2.0	0	6.3	11.2
	30	2.0	11.9	6.0	28.6
	60	2.0	19.1	6.0	28.4
			SD=0.08		

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup> Values are means based on 4 observations (2 samples, 2 replicates). SD: standard deviation.

Table 3. Changes in lactobacilli counts<sup>a</sup> of products during storage under various packaging atmospheres

Product	CO <sub>2</sub>	Initial count	Start of increase	Final count	End of increase		
	(%)	(log)	(day)	(log)	(day)		
Bologna sausage	0	1.1	3.7	7.8	23.9		
	30	0.8	4.2	6.5	28.2		
	60	0.2	11.1	5.9	22.9		
			SD=0.21				
Italian-type cooked sausage	0	2.0	9.4	3.5	14.4		
	30	1.7	10.2	5.9	27.0		
	60	1.0	11.3	5.3	27.8		
	SD=0.05						
Cooked ham	0	2.6	8.1	5.4	14.6		
	30	2.0	10.8	5.6	27.9		
	60	2.0	16.9	5.1	25.3		
			SD=0.11				

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup> Values are means based on 4 observations (2 samples, 2 replicates). SD: standard deviation.

# 146 SZALAI et al.: HEADSPACE CO<sub>2</sub> CONTENT AND COOKED MEAT PRODUCTS

Table 4. Changes in sodium nitrite levels<sup>a</sup> of products during storage under various packaging atmospheres

Product	CO <sub>2</sub>	Initial value	Start of change	Final value	End of change
	(%)	$(mg\ 100\ g^{-1})$	(day)	$(mg\ 100\ g^{-1})$	(day)
Bologna sausage	0	24.5	0	10.7	29.0
	30	24.3	0	6.7	29.0
	60	24.2	0	13.2	29.0
			SD=1.80	)	
Italian-type cooked sausage	0	14.4	0	8.7	29.0
	30	14.1	0	11.8	29.0
	60	14.3	0	13.2	29.0
			SD=0.70	)	
Cooked ham	0	8.7	0	13.4	29.0
	30	11.8	0	13.5	29.0
	60	13.2	0	13.5	29.0
			SD=0.20	)	

 $<sup>^{\</sup>rm a}$  Values are means based on 4 observations (2 samples, 2 replicates).

SD: standard deviation.

Table 5. Changes in pH<sup>a</sup> of products during storage under various packaging atmospheres

Product	CO <sub>2</sub> (%)	Initial pH	Final pH	Minimum pH	Time needed to reach minimum pH (day)
Bologna sausage	0	6.23	6.11	6.09	7.1
	30	6.12	5.95	5.89	4.4
	60	6.05	5.92	5.91	18.7
			SD	=0.02	
Italian-type cooked sausage	0	6.22	6.11	5.81	22.0
	30	6.10	6.12	5.95	17.4
	60	6.03	6.10	5.91	17.9
			SD	=0.05	
Cooked ham	0	6.24	6.16	5.89	22.7
	30	6.11	6.11	6.05	18.9
	60	6.07	6.13	5.94	17.5
			SD	=0.04	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup> Values are means based on 4 observations (2 samples, 2 replicates).

SD: standard deviation.

 $\begin{tabular}{ll} \it Table 6. \ Influence of various CO_2 \ levels in the packaging atmosphere on colour properties^a \\ & of the products tested \end{tabular}$ 

Product			SD	
<del>-</del>	0	30	60	
	Lightn	ess (L*)		
Bologna sausage	61.6	62.3	62.3	0.39
Italian-type cooked sausage	55.0	56.7	56.4	0.91
Cooked ham	57.2	56.2	56.7	1.21
Colo	our saturation {ch	roma: [(a*) <sup>2</sup> +(b*)	$)^{2}]^{1/2}$ }	
Bologna sausage	20.6	20.3	20.2	0.21
Italian-type cooked sausage	20.0	18.8	19.4	0.74
Cooked ham	13.7	14.9	15.1	1.19
	Hue	(b*/a*)		
Bologna sausage	0.92	0.91	0.91	0.01
Italian-type cooked sausage	0.94	0.94	0.91	0.06
Cooked ham	0.52	0.48	0.44	0.04

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup> Values for 0%, 30%, and 60% CO<sub>2</sub> levels are means based on 4 observations (2 samples, 2 replicates).

Table 7. Changes in odour freshness<sup>a</sup> of products during storage under various packaging atmospheres

Product	CO <sub>2</sub>	Initial score <sup>b</sup>	Start of decrease	Final score <sup>b</sup>	End of decrease		
	(%)		(day)		(day)		
Bologna sausage	0	4.0	5.4	0	29.0		
	30	4.0	26.3	1.0	29.0		
	60	4.0	24.1	0	29.0		
			SD=0.14				
Italian-type cooked sausage	0	4.0	16.5	1.0	29.0		
	30	4.0	26.0	2.0	29.0		
	60	4.0	26.0	2.0	29.0		
	SD=0.26						
Cooked ham	0	4.0	16.0	0	29.0		
	30	4.0	17.3	0	29.0		
	60	4.0	24.1	0	29.0		
			SD=0.11				

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup> Values are means based on 20 observations (5 panellists, 2 samples, 2 replicates).

SD: standard deviation.

L\*: lightness (0=black; 100=white).

a\*: redness (positive values: red, negative values: green).

b\*: yellowness (positive values: yellow, negative values: blue).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>b</sup> 4.0=best score, 0=worst score.

SD: standard deviation.

Product	CO <sub>2</sub>	Initial score <sup>b</sup>	Start of	Final score <sup>b</sup>	End of
	(%)		improvement		improvement
			(day)		(day)
Bologna sausage	0	4.0	No change	4.0	No change
	30	4.0	No change	4.0	No change
	60	1.9	4.1	4.0	18.8
			SD=0.79	)	
Italian-type cooked sausage	0	4.0	No change	4.0	No change
	30	4.0	No change	4.0	No change
	60	4.0	No change	4.0	No change
			SD=0.00	)	
Cooked ham	0	4.0	No change	4.0	No change
	30	3.0	13.4	4.0	16.6
	60	3.0	20.5	4.0	23.6
			SD=0.43	3	

Table 8. Changes in pungent (CO<sub>2</sub>) odour<sup>a</sup> of products during storage under various packaging atmospheres

As to the other micro-organisms tested, none of the samples contained a detectable count of *E. coli*, enterococci, mesophilic sulphite-reducing clostridia, *S. aureus* or *Salmonella* spp. during the entire storage period.

The initial levels of sodium nitrite were significantly higher in Bologna sausage than in Italian-type cooked sausage or cooked ham (Table 4). However, a gradual decrease occurred in the nitrite content of Bologna sausage during the 4-week storage period, whereas the levels of this component decreased only slightly in Italian-type cooked sausage and even increased in cooked ham and, thus, the final values did not differ considerably. It is clearly seen in Table 4 that the final nitrite concentrations of formulations packed under modified atmosphere containing 60% CO<sub>2</sub> were found to be almost identical.

As illustrated by initial and minimum values in Table 5, both vacuum packaging and MAP had a lowering effect on the pH of products. The pH value of Bologna sausage decreased gradually until day 10 and then remained practically unchanged for the rest of storage. As for the Italian-type cooked sausage and cooked ham, pH fell for approximately 2 weeks and increased afterwards, reaching the initial value by the end of the storage period.

Generally, composition of the packaging atmosphere did not substantially influence the colour properties of cooked meat products (Table 6). However, compared to vacuum packaging, MAP decreased the hue value of cooked ham, thereby slightly increasing the surface redness of this product.

The odour freshness of Bologna sausage packed under vacuum and modified atmospheres started declining after approximately 5 and 25 days, respectively. The final scores in Table 7 indicate that this product developed unpleasant odours by the end of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup> Values are means based on 20 observations (5 panellists, 2 samples, 2 replicates).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>b</sup> 4.0=best score, 0=worst score.

SD: standard deviation.

storage irrespective of the packaging atmosphere applied. The Italian-type cooked sausages packed under vacuum and modified atmospheres retained their fresh odour for 16 and 26 days, respectively. It is worth noting that the odour of modified atmosphere packaged samples was satisfactory throughout the storage period. The odour of cooked ham in vacuum packaging or in MAP containing 30% CO<sub>2</sub> retained freshness for 16 days, and the presence of 60% CO<sub>2</sub> in the headspace of packages resulted in extending this period by eight additional days. Similar to what was experienced with Bologna sausage, cooked ham also developed unpleasant off-odours by the end of the storage period regardless of packaging conditions.

The pungent (CO<sub>2</sub>) odour of Bologna sausage packed in modified atmosphere containing 60% CO<sub>2</sub> disappeared after 19 days (Table 8). As for cooked ham, no pungent (CO<sub>2</sub>) odour was perceived after 17 and 24 days of storage in modified atmosphere packed samples containing 30% and 60% CO<sub>2</sub>, respectively. Panellists also indicated a slightly sweet taste in modified atmosphere packaged ham. The Italian-type cooked sausages had no pungent (CO<sub>2</sub>) odour at any sampling time throughout the 29-day storage period.

Table 9 shows that vacuum packaging and MAP caused an initial improvement in the characteristic odour of sausages and cooked ham, respectively. However, this sensory attribute deteriorated during subsequent stages of storage. Bologna sausage and cooked ham were highly affected by these adverse changes, whereas the characteristic odour intensity of Italian-type cooked sausage declined only to a lesser extent.

The flavour freshness of Bologna sausage samples began declining around day 6, with MAP having a delaying effect on this undesirable process (Table 10). Italian-type cooked sausage retained its original flavour freshness for 26 days, provided that the packaging atmosphere contained at least 30% CO<sub>2</sub>, and a headspace CO<sub>2</sub> concentration of 60% resulted in excellent flavour freshness during the entire storage period. Similarly, cooked ham was also found to have outstanding flavour freshness regardless of sampling time and composition of the packaging atmosphere.

It is clearly visible in Table 11 that the presence of  $\mathrm{CO}_2$  in the headspace of packages had a beneficial effect on the characteristic flavour of both sausage varieties. It should also be noted that cooked ham had the highest initial and final scores for characteristic flavour of all three products tested.

As indicated in Table 12, Bologna sausage showed signs of slime formation after 3 weeks in vacuum packaging and after 26 days in MAP, and panellists judged all samples unfit for consumption at the end of the storage period. Vacuum packaging and MAP containing 30% CO<sub>2</sub> led to slime production after approximately 17 and 26 days, respectively, in both the Italian-type cooked sausage and cooked ham samples. In accordance with our aforementioned observations, these products were also perceived to be unpalatable on day 29. In contrast, the presence of 60% CO<sub>2</sub> in the headspace of packages provided complete protection for both cooked ham and Italian-type cooked sausage against slime formation.

Table 9. Changes in characteristic odour intensity<sup>a</sup> of products during storage under various packaging atmospheres

Product	$CO_2$	Initial score <sup>b</sup>	Start of decrease	Final score <sup>b</sup>	End of decrease		
	(%)		(day)		(day)		
Bologna sausage	0	2.3	4.8	1.1	15.2		
	30	4.0	0	2.1	22.8		
	60	4.0	0	2.2	21.6		
	-		SD=0.32				
Italian-type cooked sausage	0	2.3	10.0	2.0	17.5		
	30	4.0	No decrease	4.0	29.0		
	60	4.0	0	3.0	17.8		
	SD=0.17						
Cooked ham	0	4.0	0	1.5	2.1		
	30	2.8	14.0	1.9	17.1		
	60	3.0	13.3	2.2	22.0		
			SD=0.54				

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup> Values are means based on 20 observations (5 panellists, 2 samples, 2 replicates).

Table 10. Changes in flavour freshness<sup>a</sup> of products during storage under various packaging atmospheres

Product	$CO_2$	Initial score <sup>b</sup>	Start of decrease	Final score <sup>b</sup>	End of decrease
	(%)		(day)		(day)
Bologna sausage	0	4.0	5.5	2.0	29.0
	30	4.0	7.9	2.4	29.0
	60	4.0	5.4	3.0	29.0
			SD=0.16		
Italian-type cooked sausage	0	4.0	7.3	1.0	29.0
	30	4.0	26.1	2.0	29.0
	60	4.0	No decrease	4.0	29.0
			SD=0.16		_
Cooked ham	0	4.0	No decrease	4.0	29.0
	30	4.0	No decrease	4.0	29.0
	60	4.0	No decrease	4.0	29.0
			SD=0.00		

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup> Values are means based on 20 observations (5 panellists, 2 samples, 2 replicates).

b 4.0=best score, 0=worst score. SD: standard deviation.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>b</sup> 4.0=best score, 0=worst score.

SD: standard deviation.

Table 11. Changes in characteristic flavour intensity<sup>a</sup> of products during storage under various packaging atmospheres

Product	$CO_2$	Initial score <sup>b</sup>	Start of decrease	Final score <sup>b</sup>	End of decrease
	(%)		(day)		(day)
Bologna sausage	0	2.0	Poor throughout	0	16.0
			storage		
	30	2.3	4.5	2.0	7.0
	60	3.3	8.7	2.9	23.6
			SD=0.74		
Italian-type cooked sausage	0	2.0	Poor throughout	0	17.0
			storage		
	30	2.8	13.2	2.2	20.3
	60	4.0	0	3.1	22.1
			SD=0.66		
Cooked ham	0	4.0	No decrease	4.0	29.0
	30	4.0	0	3.0	16.5
	60	4.0	0	2.0	23.5
			SD=0.38		

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup> Values are means based on 20 observations (5 panellists, 2 samples, 2 replicates).

Table 12. Changes in slime formation<sup>a</sup> of products during storage under various packaging atmospheres

Product	CO <sub>2</sub>	Initial score <sup>b</sup>	Start of decrease	Final score <sup>b</sup>	End of decrease		
	(%)		(day)		(day)		
Bologna sausage	0	4.0	21.5	0	29.0		
	30	4.0	25.9	0	29.0		
	60	4.0	26.0	1.0	29.0		
			SD=0.22				
Italian-type cooked sausage	0	4.0	16.3	0	29.0		
	30	4.0	25.9	0	29.0		
	60	4.0	No decrease	4.0	29.0		
			SD=0.11				
Cooked ham	0	4.0	17.0	0	29.0		
	30	4.0	25.9	0	29.0		
	60	4.0	No decrease	4.0	29.0		
	SD=0.15						

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup> Values are means based on 20 observations (5 panellists, 2 samples, 2 replicates).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>b</sup> 4.0=best score, 0=worst score.

SD: standard deviation.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>b</sup> 4.0=best score, 0=worst score.

SD: standard deviation.

*Table 13.* Changes in stickiness and cohesiveness<sup>a</sup> of products during storage under various packaging atmospheres

Product	CO <sub>2</sub> (%)	Initial score <sup>b</sup>	Start of decrease (day)	Final score <sup>b</sup>	End of decrease (day)	
Bologna sausage	0	4.0	20.0	1.0	29.0	
-	30	4.0	26.0	2.0	29.0	
	60	4.0	26.0	1.0	29.0	
	SD=0.05					
Italian-type cooked sausage	0	2.0	Sticky throughout storage	2.0	29.0	
	30	4.0	No decrease	4.0	29.0	
	60	4.0	No decrease	4.0	29.0	
	SD=0.00					
Cooked ham	0	4.0	No decrease	4.0	29.0	
	30	4.0	20.4	1.9	29.0	
	60	4.0	20.4	1.9	29.0	
	SD=0.10					

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup> Values are means based on 20 observations (5 panellists, 2 samples, 2 replicates).

Table 14. Changes in drip formation<sup>a</sup> of products during storage under various packaging atmospheres

Product	CO <sub>2</sub>	Initial score <sup>b</sup>	Start of decrease	Final score <sup>b</sup>	End of decrease
	(%)		(day)		(day)
Bologna sausage	0	2.0	Dripping throughout	0	29.0
			storage		
	30	4.0	No drip	4.0	29.0
	60	4.0	26.0	2.0	29.0
	SD=0.10				
Italian-type cooked sausage	0	4.0	No drip	4.0	29.0
	30	4.0	No drip	4.0	29.0
	60	4.0	No drip	4.0	29.0
	SD=0.00				
Cooked ham	0	2.0	Dripping throughout	0	29.0
			storage		
	30	4.0	22.4	2.0	29.0
	60	4.0	26.0	2.0	29.0
	SD=0.10				

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup> Values are means based on 20 observations (5 panellists, 2 samples, 2 replicates).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>b</sup> 4.0=best score, 0=worst score.

SD: standard deviation.

b 4.0=best score, 0=worst score.

SD: standard deviation.

The cohesiveness of Bologna sausage slices declined after 20 days in vacuum packaging and after 26 days in MAP (Table 13). The vacuum packed Italian-type cooked sausage slices were sticky throughout the storage period, whereas their modified atmosphere packaged counterparts were found to be excellent in this respect. The cohesiveness of cooked ham slices packed under modified atmospheres scored 4.0 for 3 weeks and then a decline in scores was observed.

Table 14 shows that severe drip formation was experienced in the vacuum packed Bologna sausage and cooked ham from the beginning to the end of storage, whereas MAP provided some degree of protection against this quality defect. The Italian-type cooked sausage samples showed no sign of dripping over the entire storage period.

### 3. Conclusions

The influence of headspace CO<sub>2</sub> concentration on the microbiological, chemical, physical and sensory properties of the sliced cooked meat products tested in this study varied considerably and, thus, it is not possible to specify general rules.

MAP reduced the initial pH of samples, especially during the first half of storage, and enhanced their characteristic flavour. The presence of CO<sub>2</sub> in the packaging atmosphere slowed down the rate of microbial growth in each product. These results are consistent with those of ANJANEYULU and SMIDT (1986), who determined that the time of microbial growth inhibition extrapolated to 100% CO<sub>2</sub> concentration was up to 30 days in processed ham. SILLA and SIMONSEN (1985) also demonstrated the inhibitory effect of CO<sub>2</sub> on micro-organisms. In contrast, AHVENAINEN and co-workers (1989; 1990) found no significant difference in this respect between vacuum packaging and MAP containing 43 to 55% CO<sub>2</sub>. In our study, a TPC of approximately 6 log cycles resulted in a deterioration of odour and flavour and, therefore, CO2 delayed the spoilage of meat products. However, high CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations impaired the cohesiveness (i.e., sliceability) of cooked ham. In agreement with the findings of ANDERSEN and coworkers (1990) and in contrast to those of AHVENAINEN (1990), a headspace CO<sub>2</sub> concentration of 60% slightly increased the surface redness of cooked ham. In addition, it also contributed to controlled slime production and the development of a long-lasting, characteristic flavour. Compared to vacuum packaging, MAP reduced drip formation in both Bologna sausage and cooked ham. As opposed to our observations with respect to cooked ham slices, the sour odour of Bologna sausage disappeared quickly during storage, and panellists indicated no sour odour in any of the Italian-type cooked sausage samples tested.

In conclusion, the use of 60%  $\rm CO_2$  in the packaging atmosphere had beneficial effects on the microbiological and sensory properties of sliced sausages and sliced cooked ham. The shelf-life of 28 to 35 days recommended by LEISTNER and GORRIS (1994) for cooked meat products packaged under modified atmosphere containing 20%  $\rm CO_2$  seems to be rather exaggerated; a shelf-life of 20 days would be more realistic instead.

×

The funding of this work by Wihuri Oy Wipak – Wipak Budapest Office, Ringa Meat Industrial Inc., Victus Inc., and AGA Inc. is gratefully acknowledged.

The authors wish to thank Ringa Meat Industrial Inc. for the opportunity to carry out the experiments presented in this study at one of its meat processing plants. Special thanks are due to Mr. I. MÁRK, managing director of the company, and his colleagues for their kind cooperation during the trials.

Appreciation is extended to the Kapuvár Laboratory of Győr-Moson-Sopron County Animal Health Care and Food Inspection Station and the Hungarian Meat Research Institute for their technical assistance in doing the laboratory analyses.

# References

- AHVENAINEN, R. (1990): MAP of cooked and cured meats and ready meals. *Proceedings of International Conference on Modified Atmosphere Packaging*. Campden Food and Drink Research Association, Stratford-Upon-Avon, pp. 14.
- AHVENAINEN, R., KIVIKATAJA, R.L. & SKYTTÄ, E. (1990): Factors affecting the shelf-life of gas- and vacuum-packed cooked meat products. Part II: Vienna sausages. *Lebensm. Wiss. Technol.*, 23, 130–138.
- AHVENAINEN, R., SKYTTÄ, E. & KIVIKATAJA, R.L. (1989): Factors affecting the shelf-life of gas- and vacuum-packed cooked meat products. Part I: Sliced ham. *Lebensm. Wiss. Technol.*, 22, 391–398.
- ANDERSEN, H.J., BERTELSEN, G., OHLEN, A. & SKIBSTED, L.H. (1990): Modified packaging as protection against photodegradation of the colour of pasteurised, sliced ham. *Meat Sci.*, 28, 77–83.
- ANJANEYULU, A.S.R. & SMIDT, H.D. (1986): Packaging under carbon dioxide and dinitrogen oxide on the quality of processed ham. *Indian Fd. Packer*, 40 (1), 40–44.
- COMISSION INTERNATIONALE DE L'ECLAIRAGE (1978): International Commission on Illumination, Recommendations on uniform color spaces, color-difference equations, psychometric color terms. Supplement no. 2 to CIE publication no. 15(E-1.31) 1971/(TC-1.3). Bureau de la CIE, Paris.
- CHURCH, P.N. (1993): Meat products. -in: PARRY, R.T. (Ed.) Principles and applications of modified atmosphere packaging of foods. Blackie Academic & Professional, London, etc. pp. 229–268.
- DEUTSCHES INSTITUT FÜR NORMUNG (1991): Mikrobiologische Untersuchung von Fleisch und Fleischerzeugnissen. Bestimmung von Laktobazillen. DIN 10168.
- FARBER, J.M. (1991): Microbiological aspects of modified-atmosphere packaging technology. A review. J. Fd Prot., 54, 58–70.
- HUNGARIAN STANDARD (1976): Húsok és húsalapú élelmiszerek mikrobiológiai vizsgálata. Enterokokkuszok számának meghatározása. (Microbiological examination of meats and meat based foods. Enumeration of enterococci.) MSZ 3640-13.
- HUNGARIAN STANDARD (1978): Húsok és húsalapú élelmiszerek mikrobiológiai vizsgálata. A mezofil szulfitredukáló összes klosztridium és klosztridiumspóra számának meghatározása. (Microbiological examination of meats and meat-based foods. Enumeration of mesophilic sulphite-reducing clostridia and their endospores.) MSZ 3640-16.
- HUNGARIAN STANDARD (1979): Húsok és húsalapú élelmiszerek mikrobiológiai vizsgálata. Escherichia coli kimutatása és számának meghatározása folyékony tápközegből. (Microbiological examination of meats and meat based foods. Detection and enumeration of Escherichia coli in a liquid culture medium.) MSZ 3640-12
- HUNGARIAN STANDARD (1981): Húskészítmények nitrit- és nitráttartalmának kimutatása és meghatározása. (Detection and quantification of nitrite and nitrate levels in meat products.) MSZ 6905.

- HUNGARIAN STANDARD (1985): Húsok és húsalapú élelmiszerek mikrobiológiai vizsgálata. A Staphylococcus aureus számának meghatározása szilárd tápközegen, telepszámlálással. (Microbiological examination of meats and meat based foods. Enumeration of Staphylococcus aureus on a solid culture medium by colony counting.) MSZ 3640-23.
- HUNGARIAN STANDARD (1986): Húsok és húsalapú élelmiszerek mikrobiológiai vizsgálata. Aerob mikrobák számának meghatározása szilárd tápközegben, telepszámlálással. (Microbiological examination of meats and meat based foods. Enumeration of aerobic micro-organisms in a solid culture medium by colony counting.) MSZ 3640-3.
- HUNGARIAN STANDARD (1999): Élelmiszerek és takarmányok mikrobiológiai vizsgálata. Horizontális módszer a szalmonellák kimutatására. (Microbiological examination of foods and animal feeds. Horizontal method for detection of Salmonella spp.) MSZ EN 12824.
- LAKNER, Z. (1994): Az agrármarketing kiegészítő funkciói. (The supplementary functions of agromarketing.) -in: LEHOTA, J. & TOMCSÁNYI, P. (Eds) *Agrármarketing*. Mezőgazda Kiadó, Budapest, pp. 212–226.
- LAKNER, Z. (1997): Versenyképesség, minőség, élelmiszerfizika. (Competitiveness, quality and food physics.) Élelmiszerfizikai Közlemények, 10 (1–2), 63–76.
- LEFEVRE, D. (1990): The effects of modified atmospheres upon micro-organisms. *Proceedings of International Conference on Modified Atmosphere Packaging*. Campden Food and Drink Research Association, Stratford-Upon-Avon, pp. 14.
- LEISTNER, L. & GORRIS, L.G.M. (1994): Food preservation by combined processes. *Final Report of FLAIR Concerted Action No. 7, Subgroup B, EUR 15776 EN.* Commission of the European Community, Directorate-General XII, Brussels, pp. 100.
- OORAIKUL, B. (1991): Further research in modified atmosphere packaging. -in: OORAIKUL, B. & STILES, M.E. (Eds) *Modified atmosphere packaging of food.* Ellis Horwood, New York, pp. 125–144.
- SILLA, H. & SIMONSEN, B. (1985): Shelf-life of cured, cooked and sliced meat products. I. Influence of composition, vacuum packaging and modified atmospheres. Fleischwirtschaft, 65, 66–69.
- ZWIETERING, M.H., JONGENBURGER, I., ROMBOUTS, F.M. & VAN'T RIET, K. (1990): Modeling of the bacterial growth curve. *Appl. environ. Microbiol.*, *56*, 1875–1881.